

Written evidence submitted by the Cultural Learning Alliance

Which programmes best demonstrate the positive social impact that participating in sport and culture can have on the five central themes of this inquiry?

1. The arts empower children. Access to the arts and culture is access to our national life, and is the universal right of every child. Every child's entitlement should be met. Cultural capital – the factual knowledge, intellectual skills and emotional intelligence that are gained through exposure to the arts – is acquired over time, as children are introduced to the ideas, images and values that constitute the culture of their families, their communities, and the wider world. Children and families who feel ownership of the arts and culture feel more confident in their ability to create, challenge and explore, to be a part of society and to make change happen. Children denied this access can feel locked out and left behind.
2. The Cultural Learning Alliance has collected and collated a great deal of evidence of the impact of participation in culture against the five themes of this Inquiry. We have summarized the headlines of this evidence in our response.
3. **Our 10 Key Findings**
 - Participation in structured arts activities can increase cognitive abilities by 17%.
 - Learning through arts and culture can improve attainment in Maths and English.
 - Learning through arts and culture develops skills and behaviour that lead children to do better in school.
 - Students from low-income families who take part in arts activities at school are three times more likely to get a degree.
 - Employability of students who study arts subjects is higher and they are more likely to stay in employment.
 - Students from low-income families who engage in the arts at school are twice as likely to volunteer.
 - Students from low-income families who engage in the arts at school are 20% more likely to vote as young adults.
 - Young offenders who take part in arts activities are 18% less likely to re-offend.
 - Children who take part in arts activities in the home during their early years are ahead in reading and Maths at age nine.
 - People who take part in the arts are 38% more likely to report good health.

Read the Key Research Findings in full at: www.culturallearningalliance.org.uk/evidence

Headlines from well-evidenced initiatives

Social Mobility

4. Development of cultural capital associated with engagement in the arts contributes to social mobility – Sutton Trust Leading People (Kirby, 2016)
5. Participating in structured arts activities led to increases in transferable skills (including confidence and communication) of between 10–17% (CASE, 2010: p.29). Findings from the Centre for the Economics of Education at LSE show that transferable skills improve labour market outcomes (Carneiro et al, 2007 & Feinstein, 2000).
6. Using the NELS:88 cohort study in the US, Catterall found that students who had intensive arts experiences in high school were three times more likely than students who lacked those experiences to earn a bachelor's degree. They also were more likely to earn 'mostly A's' in college (17% versus 5% of low socio-economic status students) (2012: p.16). Catterall also found that Both 8th-grade and high school students who had high levels of arts engagement were more likely to aspire to college than were students with less arts engagement (2012: p.14).
7. An earlier study by Catterall also found that the education advantages to the students with high arts involvement appeared to increase over time, and arts-engaged low-income students tend to perform more like average higher- income students (President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities [PCAH] 2011: p.18).
8. The Sutton Trust has found extraversion, self-esteem, and a positive outlook as particularly beneficial for career success, and an external locus of control (a belief that one's successes and failures are outside one's control) to be particularly detrimental.
 - a. School children taking part in the National Theatre's 'Transformation' project increased their self esteem compared to peers who do not take part. (Merrell & Tymms, 2002. [Report](#))
 - b. When compared to a control group, children in Canada who took part in regular arts activities showed significant improvements in social skills and task completion. (Schellenberg et al, 2015. From [culturecase.org](#))
 - c. Dance has been shown to improve teenage girl's self-esteem. (Connolly et al, 2011)

Wellbeing and health

9. A Scottish study found that people who had participated in a creative or cultural activity were 38% more likely to report good health compared to those who did not; and for those who participated in dance, the figure rises to 62% (Leadbetter & O'Connor, 2013).
10. Italian data shows that cultural access is the second most important determinant of wellbeing, above factors including occupation, age, income and education (Grossi, 2010 & 2012).
11. Different types of art activities increase different elements of health and wellbeing. Dance improves the physical health of participants, in particular teenage girls who are not engaging in other physical activity (Connolly et al, 2011). Shared reading has been found to improve an individual's sense of purpose. Theatre and drama improve young

people's social skills and emotional wellbeing. We also know that engaging in the arts increases young people's resilience – a key component of good mental health.

- a. Participating in arts lowers cortisol levels in blood stream (lowers stress) (Kreutz, et al. 2004).
- b. Learning to play an instrument has been shown to help children better cope with stress (Roden et al, 2016).

Criminal justice

12. One-third of young people in the youth justice system who completed the Summer Arts Colleges moved up a level in literacy and numeracy (Stephenson et al, 2014: p.83).
13. Re-offending rates among young people who took part in Summer Arts Colleges (SACs) were 54% compared to a national re-offending rate of 72% (Stephenson et al, 2014: p.92).
14. Completion of a Summer Arts College meant that a young person was nearly four times more likely to be a high 'engager' in education training and employment post-programme (Stephenson et al, 2014: p.84)
15. US data shows that At-risk teenagers or young adults with a history of intensive arts experiences show achievement levels closer to, and in some cases exceeding, the levels shown by the general population studied (Catterall, 2012: p.24).

Education

16. Taking part in structured arts activities can increase children's cognitive ability test scores by between 16% and 19% (CASE, 2010: p.29).
17. Children who engaged in home activities including arts achieved higher NAPLAN (Australia's National Assessment Program Literacy and Numeracy) reading and numeracy scores equivalent to being 12 weeks of schooling ahead in reading and six weeks ahead in numeracy (Yu & Daraganova, 2015).
18. Range of studies with control groups showing improvements in grades of students who engage in structured arts activities. Eg:
 - a. Singing can help with language learning (Ludke et al, 2014).
 - b. Music increases IQ (Schellenberg, 2004).
 - c. Hong Kong research shows particular improvements in creativity and communication through studying visual arts (Hui, He and Sam Ye, 2015).
 - d. 'Teenagers and young adults of low socio-economic status (SES) who have a history of in-depth arts involvement show better academic outcomes than do low-SES youth who have less arts involvement. They earn better grades and demonstrate higher rates of college enrolment and attainment.' (Catterall, 2012: p.12)
 - e. Canadian research reported increases in maths ability after three years of arts education compared to control schools (Smithrim & Uptis, 2005)

19. Right to Read programme reported increases in social skills and self-esteem (Griffiths et al, 2007) and smaller studies with control groups have shown increases in self-esteem and self-efficacy (the sense that they have confidence in their ability to overcome problems and achieve goals) for young people taking part in drama (Fleming et al, 2004), and visual arts (Catterall and Peppler, 2007).
20. In the surveys at ages three and five for the UK cohort study Child of the New Century (CNC), mothers were asked how often they helped their child with reading and writing and activities such as drawing and painting. Researchers have found that children who had these types of interactions in their pre-school years tend to display better behaviour and moods, and higher ability in reading and Maths (Child of the New Century, 2016).

Community engagement

21. CASE found in their 2015 systematic review of relevant literature that Volunteering and caring are both developed by arts engagement (Taylor et al, 2015: p.84).
22. Students from low-income families who engage in the arts at school are twice as likely to volunteer (Catterall, 2009)
23. Students from low-income families who engage in the arts at school are 20% more likely to vote as young adults (Catterall, 2009)
24. In the US the NELS:88 survey tracked 12,000 participants through to age 26. Looking specifically at the outcomes of students from low socio-economic status (SES) backgrounds, at the age of 26 they found that 24.3% of those who had been engaged in the arts at school were volunteering compared to 10.8% of non-engaged students (Catterall, 2009).
25. In addition, in both high-and low-SES groups, young adults who had arts-rich experiences in high school were more likely than other young adults to have volunteered recently (Catterall, 2012: p.19).
26. Using time diaries compiled over four days at age16 by participants in the British Cohort Study of 1970, and controlling for other factors such as family background, Robson found that art and music-related leisure, reading for pleasure and visiting a museum during the reference period at age 16 increased the odds of civic engagement at 29 (2003: p.23).
27. Catterall found that high-arts students are about 15 percent more likely to register to vote, more than 30 percent more likely to have voted in the most recent presidential election, and about 20 percent more likely to have voted in any election in the 24 months leading to the last NELS survey panel (Catterall, 2009: p.64). Young adults who had arts-rich experiences in high school were more likely to vote and/or to participate in a political campaign. Virtually all of these differences were observed only in low socio-economic status groups.

How can access to cultural and sporting professions be improved to enable greater diversity? How can the Government build a pipeline of talent?

28. The knowledge, skills and experience made possible by the arts are essential to young people's development. A strong arts education is the key to diversifying our workforce, tackling social inequality and giving young people the skills they need to innovate and to contribute to the global economy.
29. We need **careers advice** that is delivered locally by specialists; clusters of education and industry partners, and which reflects real jobs and careers. This should be built around key national resources such as Creative and Cultural Skills [Creative Choices website](#).
30. We are calling for **changes to the deployment of the Apprenticeships Levy** funds to allow for local and sectoral-footprint coordination and support for Creative Apprenticeships. Apprenticeships in our sector have seen some of the fastest growth in uptake over the last five years; four times faster than any other sector.
31. We also need **new technical qualifications (T-levels)** to be developed in real partnership with industry, and to reflect the needs of the freelancers and micro-businesses that make up the creative sector.
32. For every child to access arts and culture, it is essential that the arts and cultural sector work in partnership with the education sector. This requires a thriving and stable sector, which in turn **requires sustained, regular investment** in arts and culture at current levels and in line with inflation across the whole country.
33. It is essential that the arts and culture, and education, are given **the right sector deals as part of the UK's exit from the European Union**. We need a package that ensures our talent pipeline, our access to funding and free movement of people.
34. Employers are clear that they want to see children and young people with the creative, entrepreneurial and communication skills that a study of the arts offers, but parents, young people, teachers and universities do not always receive this message clearly. More needs to be done to **communicate the value of the arts and culture to parents**.
35. The Government should mirror the current [Premium for PE and Sport](#) (where every school with primary age pupils gets ring-fenced funds of approximately £16,000 per school for the promotion of PE and Sport). **It should create an equivalent for the arts and wellbeing** or widen the scheme to include the arts.

Why has the Government not co-ordinated its efforts more effectively?

36. There are a number of underlying issues that must be addressed by government and the sector working together:

Education

37. The current **recruitment and funding crises in schools must be addressed** or the arts will become an unintended casualty. There are widespread reports of cuts to arts courses and to specialist teachers in schools. Cultural Learning Alliance figures show a drop of 28% in uptake of arts courses at GCSE since 2010 and a 17% decline in the number of hours taught in arts subjects and a 16% decline in the numbers of specialist teachers in secondary schools.
38. **We need a school system that is well-resourced** and which focusses on equality of access to the arts and culture for all children and young people. We want every young person to be given the opportunity to develop their social and cultural capital, and have not seen any evidence that a system that is more focussed on selection is the way to achieve this. We are also aware that schools are experiencing real-term financial cuts of around 8%, with these set to increase. Schools must be adequately funded for the arts, and all subjects, to thrive.
39. The English Baccalaureate has become the overarching policy priority for secondary schools, with current DfE proposals to judge secondary schools as many as six times on the same measure (Progress 8, Attainment 8, EBacc numbers, EBacc achievement, Ofsted, EBacc average point score). This cannot be efficient or effective. **The accountability system needs to be radically simplified**, reducing needless bureaucracy and creating much more choice for children and families. At the same time, we want to see government and the arts sector working together actively promote the benefits of culture in education.

Local government

40. Local Authorities are the largest overall funders of the arts and culture. Over the last seven years, significant cuts have been made to local authorities (LAs). These cuts have been difficult for authorities to absorb and have been passed on to arts and cultural organisations, to schools and to education providers. As these cuts continue we expect to see more and more organisations struggling to survive, despite the innovative models and flexible approaches that they are developing in response.
41. We are calling for a commitment to place the arts and culture at the heart of regeneration strategies, city and devolution and Growth Deals, as well as inclusion within Local Economic Partnerships, local businesses and within Higher Education partnerships.

Early Years

42. Policy and provision for early years and families – both targeted to those most in need and universally offered to all – is essential to local wellbeing, community and successful social care.

43. The Government should consider developing training for Early Years Professionals so that they are confident and comfortable in using the arts in their practice. It should use existing structures (such as the Health Visitor network – accessed by every new parent) to signpost families to the local arts and cultural offer, as it does with Bookstart, and to promote and support cultural learning in the home.
44. Early years Ofsted inspectors should also be trained to recognise and assess the development of creativity in young children as well as creative teaching.
45. Although much of the evidence on social mobility and life chances points to the need for early intervention and engagement with children under five and their families, there has been no sustained, joined-up policy or investment into an arts and cultural offer in this area. In addition, the new 30 hours free childcare policy does not give adequate funding for settings, leading to cuts in provision.

A need for national government departments to work together

46. At a national level, government policy is not joined-up. This is particularly evident between the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS) and the Department of Education (DfE). The DfE consistently produces policy and initiatives which do not relate to or join-up with the work that the DCMS delivers.
47. In the past six months the Department for Education has published a number of important strategic papers: The Social Mobility Strategy, : Unlocking Talent, Fulfilling Potential, the Careers Strategy and the Children’s Mental Health Green Paper. Despite the clear contribution that the arts and culture make to each of these areas, there is no mention of them in any of these documents. Similarly, the recent Industrial Strategy includes no real, concrete policy or plans for the education elements that will be crucial to ensuring a workforce that can take forward the government’s vision. This is not a new picture and was also the case in the most recent Culture White Paper and Education White Paper – which did not relate to one another at all.
48. **We join What Next? in recommending a national cross-government taskforce is set up to look at the five themes of this Inquiry and to expressly look at ways in which departments can work together.**

Has the sport sector been better for social mobility than the arts? If so, why?

49. We do not believe that it is helpful to draw comparisons between the arts and sports sectors. Both are beneficial and valuable to young people and communities.

How can museums, galleries and other cultural venues boost access and social impact?

As a sector we aim to:

- Increase partnerships with local services, schools, parents and other arts and cultural partners to **ensure that every child and young person has access to high-quality cultural learning**. We **actively embrace and promote STEAM** – the inclusion of the arts into the STEM agenda – and we will continue to **develop new models of Apprenticeship delivery that work for our sector and which help the government to reach its targets**.
- Take our place on **Local Economic Partnerships**, ensuring that the arts and cultural sector and creative industries are directly contributing to long-term local growth, jobs and talent development.
- **Work closely with Universities** to build on successful existing partnership models that support resilience, research and development, risk taking, and community and social impact.
- **Diversify our sector and make it fairer**: putting in place practical and tailored measures to ensure that we remove barriers to progression and ensure our organisations, the arts and culture we create, celebrate and share, and the artists we work with and enable, are fully representative of our communities.

About the CLA

The Cultural Learning Alliance (CLA) is a collective voice working to ensure that all children and young people have meaningful access to culture. It is supported by a membership of more than 8,500 organisations and individuals.

Arts and culture are a life-enhancing and essential part of our existence. They bring pleasure, participation, self-expression and essential skills into children's lives. By speaking with one voice and working together, we can realise our ambition for all children and young people to have an entitlement to quality cultural learning.

The Alliance brings together the diverse parts of the cultural sector to work together – including museums, film, libraries, heritage, dance, literature, new media arts, theatre, visual arts and music – with the education and youth sector.

The CLA aims to use our collective skills and voice to:

- Develop and advocate for a coherent national strategy for cultural learning
- Unite the education, youth and cultural sectors
- Demonstrate why cultural learning is so important

www.culturallearningalliance.org.uk

References

Carneiro, Pedro, Crawford, Claire and Goodman, Alissa (2007) *The Impact of Early Cognitive and Non-Cognitive Skills on Later Outcomes*. London: Centre for the Economics of Education.

Catterall, James S. (2009) *Doing Well and Doing Good by Doing Art*. Los Angeles: I-Group Books

Catterall, James S. and Pepler, Kylie A. (2007) 'Learning in the visual arts and the worldviews of young children' *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 37(4)

Catterall, James S., Dumais, Susan A. and Hampden-Thompson, Gillian (2012) *The arts and achievements in at-risk youth: findings from longitudinal studies*. Washington: National Endowment for the Arts. Available at: <https://www.arts.gov/sites/default/files/Arts-At-Risk-Youth.pdf>

Child of the New Century. (2016) Home and Family [Online]. Available at: <http://www.cls.ioe.ac.uk/cnc/page.aspx?sitesectionid=64&sitesectiontitle=Home+and+family>

Connolly, M.K., Quinn, E. and Redding, E. (2011) 'Dance 4 your life: exploring the health and well-being implications of a contemporary dance intervention for female adolescents' *Research in Dance Education*, 12(1), pp.53–66

Culture and Sport Evidence Programme (CASE) (2010) *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport*. London: DCMS

Feinstein, Leon (2000) *The Relative Economic Importance of Academic, Psychological and Behavioural Attributes Developed in Childhood*. London: Centre for Economic Performance.

Fleming, Mike, Merrell, Christine and Tymms, Peter. (2004) 'The impact of drama on pupils' language, mathematics, and attitude in two primary schools, Research in Drama Education' *The Journal of Applied Theatre and Performance*, 9(2) pp.177–197

Griffiths, Viv, Blishen, Susan and Vincent, John. (2007) *Right to Read 2001 – 2005: summary of the current outcomes*. London: Paul Hamlyn Foundation. Available at: http://www.seapn.org.uk/content_files/files/right_to_read_2001_2005_summary_of_outcomes_1.doc

Grossi, E. et al. (2010) 'The impact of culture on the individual subjective well-being of the Italian population: an exploratory study' *Applied Research in Quality of Life*. 6(4) pp.387–410

Grossi, E., et al. (2012) "The Interaction Between Culture, Health and Psychological Well-Being: Data Mining from the Italian Culture and Well-Being Project." *Journal of Happiness Studies* 13: 129-148.

Hui, Anna N. N., He, Mavis W. J. and Ye, Shengquan Sam. (2015) 'Arts education and creativity enhancement in young children in Hong Kong'. *Educational Psychology*, 35(3)

Kirby, Philip (2016) *LEADING PEOPLE 2016 The educational backgrounds of the UK professional elite*. London: Sutton Trust

Kreutz, G., Bongard, S, Rohrmann, S., Grebe, D., Bastian, H.G. & Hodapp, V. (2004). *Effects of choir singing or listening on secretory immunoglobulin A, cortisol and emotional state*, *Journal of Behavioural Medicine*, 27(6), 623-635.

LaMore, R., Root-Bernstein, R., Root-Bernstein, M., Schweitzer, J.H., Lawton, J.L., Roraback, E., Peruski, A., VanDyke M., and Fernandez, L. (2013). [*Arts and Crafts: Critical to Economic Innovation in Economic Development Quarterly August 2013; vol. 27, 3*](#). Michigan: Michigan State University for Community and Economic Development 221-229

Leadbetter, C. and O'Connor, N. (2013) *Healthy Attendance? The Impact of Cultural Engagement and Sports Participation on Health and Satisfaction with Life in Scotland*. Scottish Government Social Research.

Ludke, K. M., Ferreira, F. and Overy, K. (2014) 'Singing can facilitate foreign language learning'. *Memory & Cognition*, 42(1), pp. 41–52.

Merrell, C., Tymms, P. (2002). *National Theatre Transformation project: final evaluation report*. Durham: University of Durham.

President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities (2011) *Reinvesting in Arts Education: Winning America's Future through Creative Schools*. Washington DC: PCAH

Robson, Karen. (2003) 'Teenage Time Use as Investment in Cultural Capital' *Working Papers of the Institute for Social and Economic Research paper 2003–12*. Colchester: University of Essex

Roden, I., et al. (2016) "Effects of music and natural science training on aggressive behavior." *Learning and Instruction*, 45, 85-92

Root-Bernstein, R. (2008). [*Arts Foster Success: Comparison of Nobel Prizewinners, Royal Society, National Academy, and Sigma Xi Members*](#). New York: Springer Publishing Company

Schellenberg EG, Corrigan KA, Dys SP, Malti T. (2015) 'Group Music Training and Children's Prosocial Skills.' *PLOS ONE* 10(10): e0141449. Accessed 5 May 2017
<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0141449>

Schellenberg, E. G. (2004) 'Music lessons enhance IQ' *Psychological Science*, 15(8) pp.511–514

Siepel, J., Camerani, R., Pellegrino, G., and Masucci, M. (2016). [*The Fusion Effect: the economic returns to combining arts and science skills*](#). London: Nesta.

Smithrim, K. and Upitis, R. (2005) 'Learning through the arts: lessons of engagement' *Canadian Journal of Education*, 28(12) pp.109–127

Stephenson, Martin, Adams, Maree and Tarling, Roger. (2014) *The Art of Engagement: Outcomes and Impact of the Summer Arts College Programme 2007–12*. Norwich: Unitas

Taylor, Peter, Davies, Larissa, Wells, Peter, Gilbertson, Jan and Tayleur, William. (2015) *A review of the Social Impacts of Culture and Sport*. London: CASE

Yu, M. and Daraganova, G. (2014) 'Children's early home learning environment and learning outcomes in the early years of school' in *The Longitudinal Study of Australian Children Annual statistical report 2014*, A. I. o. F. Studies, ed. Melbourne: AIFS

February 2018