



House of Commons
Committee of Public Accounts

BBC Digital

Forty-Sixth Report of Session 2022–23

*Report, together with formal minutes relating
to the report*

*Ordered by the House of Commons
to be printed 20 March 2023*

The Committee of Public Accounts

The Committee of Public Accounts is appointed by the House of Commons to examine “the accounts showing the appropriation of the sums granted by Parliament to meet the public expenditure, and of such other accounts laid before Parliament as the committee may think fit” (Standing Order No. 148).

Current membership

[Dame Meg Hillier MP](#) (*Labour (Co-op), Hackney South and Shoreditch*) (Chair)

[Olivia Blake MP](#) (*Labour, Sheffield, Hallam*)

[Dan Carden MP](#) (*Labour, Liverpool, Walton*)

[James Cartlidge MP](#) (*Conservative, South Suffolk*)

[Mr Simon Clarke MP](#) (*Conservative, Middlesbrough South and East Cleveland*)

[Sir Geoffrey Clifton-Brown MP](#) (*Conservative, The Cotswolds*)

[Mr Jonathan Djanogly MP](#) (*Conservative, Huntingdon*)

[Mrs Flick Drummond MP](#) (*Conservative, Meon Valley*)

[Rt Hon Mark Francois MP](#) (*Conservative, Rayleigh and Wickford*)

[Mr Louie French MP](#) (*Conservative, Old Bexley and Sidcup*)

[Peter Grant MP](#) (*Scottish National Party, Glenrothes*)

[Anne Marie Morris MP](#) (*Conservative, Newton Abbot*)

[Jill Mortimer MP](#) (*Conservative, Hartlepool*)

[Sarah Olney MP](#) (*Liberal Democrat, Richmond Park*)

[Nick Smith MP](#) (*Labour, Blaenau Gwent*)

Powers

Powers of the Committee of Public Accounts are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No. 148. These are available on the Internet via www.parliament.uk.

Publication

© Parliamentary Copyright House of Commons 2023. This publication may be reproduced under the terms of the Open Parliament Licence, which is published at <https://www.parliament.uk/site-information/copyright-parliament/>.

Committee reports are published on the [Committee’s website](#) and in print by Order of the House.

Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are Jessica Bridges-Palmer (Media Officer), Ameet Chudasama (Committee Operations Manager), Sarah Heath (Clerk), Tom Lacy (Chair Liaison), Rose Leach (Committee Operations Officer), Ben Rayner (Second Clerk).

Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Committee of Public Accounts, House of Commons, London SW1A 0AA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 5776; the Committee’s email address is pubaccom@parliament.uk.

You can follow the Committee on Twitter using [@CommonsPAC](#).

Contents

Summary	3
Introduction	4
Conclusions and recommendations	5
1 Planning and funding	8
Planning for an internet future	9
Funding the digital strategy	10
2 People and data	12
Staff recruitment and retention	12
Personalised services	13
Data security	13
Formal minutes	15
Witnesses	16
Published written evidence	16
List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament	17

Summary

The BBC is increasingly investing in digital products. As of September 2022, 88% of the time that BBC audiences spent with its services was through traditional television and radio broadcasting. But more people are moving towards digital services year-on-year and the BBC considers that it needs to plan for a future where TV and radio distribution is only provided through the internet. We welcome the BBC's continued commitment to its universal service obligation and note that it is not actively putting a date on switchover (it expects this transition to take place through the 2030s). We caution that the BBC must not move too quickly towards digital only, leaving behind those with poor access to digital services. Maintaining universal service will depend on sufficient broadband coverage across the UK and the BBC will need to work with the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport, which is also responsible for broadband roll-out, to address digital exclusion issues.

The BBC is operating in a very competitive environment across multiple genres and competing against different types of organisations including traditional broadcasters, streamers and audio services. Despite this the BBC has the advantages of its breadth of content, including live coverage, and its support for older technology for longer than its rivals. The BBC's key digital products are performing well when compared with its rivals. This is despite it only spending £98 million in 2021–22 on digital product development compared with £1.7 billion spent by Netflix on technology and development.

However, we are not convinced that the BBC currently knows the detail of the resources needed to achieve its digital plans and whether the £500 million to be invested annually by 2025 will be sufficient to also allow it to plan for an internet only future. It will need to develop clearer financial plans including which services it will close and what happens if it does not make the savings required elsewhere to allow it to reinvest in digital development.

The BBC wants to provide a more personalised service for its audiences but, unlike many of its rivals, it will need to develop a personalisation strategy that is consistent with public service obligations. It will need to move more quickly on this and in parallel develop its data security policies to ensure they are fit for purpose as the BBC collects more user data.

Introduction

The BBC is independent of government but is sponsored by the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport and regulated by Ofcom, the communications regulator. The BBC is primarily funded by the television licence fee, which gave it £3.8 billion of its £5.3 billion income in 2021–22. For a number of years, the BBC has sought to complement its traditional television and radio broadcasting through developing its digital services. It launched its homepage in 1997, iPlayer in 2007, and now offers an array of apps and websites. The BBC now competes not only with television and radio broadcasters, but also with online providers, often based overseas and funded by private capital.

In September 2020, the BBC's Director-General launched its Value for All strategy, a priority of which is extracting "more value from online". This means using technology and data to offer audiences a greater range of services through a portfolio of digital products including iPlayer, Sounds as well as apps for news and sport. In October 2020, the BBC commenced a strategic technology review to determine its technology requirements for the following five years and beyond. Following this, in May 2022 it announced that it would be taking a new 'digital-first' approach.

Conclusions and recommendations

1. **The BBC has not yet started planning for a future where radio and television are only accessed through the internet, including how it will work with government and other stakeholders.** In December 2022, the BBC's Director-General set out where the BBC would need to be by the 2030s and announced it would move to an internet-only future with greater urgency. Although, it appears to have rowed back from some of the details of its announcement, or at least from what was reported, the BBC is bullish about moving to a fully digital future. We have kept a close eye on progress as the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport's has worked with industry to roll out broadband across the UK. We understand the challenges associated with this as well as the varying speeds nationwide and therefore the possibility of leaving audiences behind in an internet-only future. The BBC confirmed its commitment to universality and to ensuring audiences are not digitally excluded. It closed BBC Three as a linear channel in 2016 and moved it online, but then reopened it six years later; an example of where it moved too soon, and audiences did not follow. The BBC therefore recognises the need to plan for an internet future and to get the timing right. It knows it needs to work with government and other stakeholders to ensure nobody is excluded due to a lack of confidence in adopting the necessary technologies, access to them, or because of affordability.

Recommendation 1: The BBC should develop a detailed plan including scenarios for how it could switch to an internet-only future, working with government, audience representatives and wider stakeholders, to ensure no-one is left behind.

2. **The BBC has a high-level plan in place for its £500 million of annual savings and reinvestment into digital, but it is unclear whether this will cover its new ambition to transition to an internet-only future in the 2030s.** Following its January 2022 licence fee settlement with government, the BBC estimated that it would have a funding gap of £285 million a year by 2027–28. It says that has now increased to nearly £400 million due to inflation, in addition to its funding being cut by 30% in real terms over the past 10 years. The BBC has an overarching target for its digital services to be within at least the top three for UK market share. As part of its digital first plan, announced in May 2022, it committed to an additional £50 million for digital product development from 2025. However, the BBC has not fully determined the details of its £500 million digital investment plan and reports that it is refining the detail required through its current budgeting process. Its plan is heavily dependent on it being able to achieve further savings for reinvestment, but it did not say what it will do if these saving targets become unachievable.

Recommendation 2: The BBC should write to the Committee, within two months and once its budget is finalised for the financial year, with reassurance that it has developed the necessary detail in support of its digital investment plan. It should set out:

- *if its £500 million annual investment by 2025 is sufficient to achieve its plans;*
- *how it will achieve all the required savings; and*

- *what will happen to its digital plans if it is unable to achieve its savings target.*

3. **The BBC faces a significant challenge in a very competitive market to recruit and retain staff with the right digital skills.** The BBC had a 23% staff turnover rate in its digital product group as of June 2022. Shortages of digital skills are an economy-wide challenge that is not unique to the BBC, and we have regularly heard of similar challenges across government itself, for example with our recent inquiry into the defence digital strategy. The BBC reports that these challenges became more complex during 2022 because of the consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic leading to wage increases as well as more staff working remotely, with people in a local area becoming part of a wider, sometimes international, recruitment market. However, the BBC says that attrition rates are now reducing and its ability to recruit and retain staff is improving. The BBC does not pay digital staff as much as many of its rivals. It acknowledges that it has increased the ranges for some of its digital jobs by more than the standard pay rise that it gave to most of its employees last year. While salaries are important, the BBC also seeks to make the most of its inherent attractiveness as an employer giving the opportunity to work on a very wide range of products compared to others and also supporting a public service purpose.

Recommendation 3: The BBC should develop a plan for how it will maintain its recent progress in recruiting and retaining specialist digital staff including succession planning specific to the key digital skills that it needs for the future.

4. **The BBC's approach to how it will develop personalised services for audiences is not yet well developed.** The BBC wants to personalise its products and services such that audiences can access content that is of interest to them, while also fulfilling its public service obligations. The BBC sees this as a new and interesting challenge and says that, unlike its commercial rivals, it aims to strike a careful balance through human curation of content as well as the use of algorithms. It recognises that its public service obligations should be at the heart of its personalisation strategy. The BBC has spoken about personalisation ambitions over the past nine years and worked to personalise individual products such as the iPlayer. But there is as yet no comprehensive personalisation strategy in place to show what this would look like in practice.

Recommendation 4: The BBC should move more quickly on the development of a personalisation strategy that serves its public sector purposes while fulfilling its ambitions for a more tailored experience for its audiences. It should write to the Committee on its progress by December 2023.

5. **The BBC has developed its approach to data security since 2019 but is not yet doing enough to manage the risks arising from increased access to users' personal data.** The BBC needs to collect and hold some audience data to help it to compete in the digital space, and crucial to this is sign-in, where audiences register for and use a BBC account to access its digital services. The BBC has a sign-in strategy, with a target for 72% of digital product views to come from signed-in users by 2023. It also has an overall goal of 23.5 million signed-in users by 2023. The BBC tries not to collect or hold more data about audiences than is necessary and reassured us that it has no plans to commercialise the data that it collects. That makes it distinct from

other digital providers. The BBC appointed a data protection officer in 2019 and also set up a central data protection team. However, the increased use of personal data exposes the BBC to more potential risks and it has not shown clearly that its active management of those risks is yet sufficiently embedded. The BBC has assured us that there have been no significant data breaches in the current financial year.

Recommendation 5: The BBC should review its data collection and storage policies and work out the minimum amount of data that is needed to achieve its goals, what will be sufficient for its personalisation strategy, and how it will keep that data safe.

1 Planning and funding

1. On the basis of a report by the Comptroller and Auditor General, we took evidence from the BBC about its plans for digital transformation.¹

2. The BBC is the main public service broadcaster in the UK. Its mission, public purposes, commitments and governance arrangements are set out in its Royal Charter. Under its Charter, the BBC has five public purposes including providing impartial news and reflecting the UK, its culture and its values to the world. The BBC is independent of government but is sponsored by the Department for Digital, Culture, Media & Sport and regulated by Ofcom, the communications regulator. The BBC is primarily funded by the television licence fee, which gave it £3.8 billion of its £5.3 billion income in 2021–22.²

3. Although 88% of the time audiences currently spend with the BBC is through traditional television and radio broadcasting, it has for a number of years sought to complement these with digital services. It launched its homepage in 1997, iPlayer in 2007, and now offers an array of apps and websites. The BBC now competes not only with television and radio broadcasters, but also with online providers, often based overseas and funded by private capital, including Netflix, Amazon Prime and Disney+, and audio services including Spotify.³

4. The BBC lacks the funds to offer the same amount of content as other media organisations, many of which are digital-only. Its more limited investment ability has restricted the technological sophistication of its products. The BBC has identified where it needs to make improvements, including in its search functions and content recommendations. Nevertheless, the BBC’s digital services are performing well. In 2021–22 most of the BBC’s digital products achieved their targets. Notably, iPlayer usage far exceeds the BBC’s target: the average weekly hours played through iPlayer was 39.7 million in 2020–21, against a target of 31 million to 33 million hours. The BBC now plans for its digital services to be within at least the top three for market share in the UK in five years’ time.⁴

5. The BBC sees its digital services as essential to its long-term future. In September 2020, the BBC’s Director-General launched its Value for All strategy, a priority of which is extracting “more value from online”. This means using technology and data to offer audiences a greater range of services through a portfolio of digital products including iPlayer, Sounds as well as apps for news and sport. In October 2020, the BBC commenced a strategic technology review to determine its technology requirements for the following five years and beyond. Following this, in May 2022 it announced that it would be taking a new ‘digital-first’ approach. This will mean refocusing resources towards content that appeals to audiences who choose to view it both live online, and on any device at any time.⁵

1 C&AG’s Report, *A digital BBC*, HC 958, 9 December 2022

2 C&AG’s Report, para 1

3 C&AG’s Report, para 2

4 C&AG’s Report, paras 14, 3.6

5 C&AG’s Report, para 3

Planning for an internet future

6. In December 2022, the BBC’s Director-General followed up on the May announcement, describing the BBC’s vision for where it should aim to be by the 2030s and setting out plans to move to an internet future with greater urgency.⁶ He stated that the BBC would be active in future in planning for the switching off traditional broadcasting. However, as reported by the National Audit Office, also last December, the BBC has only conducted limited work planning out scenarios in which it could potentially move away from traditional broadcasting at a more wholesale, strategic level. Nor had it set out those older services which it will protect, or the wider implications of removing certain broadcast channels for access by disabled audiences and other groups at risk of being digitally excluded.⁷

7. At our evidence session in January 2023, the Director-General reiterated to us the need for urgency and how, by any forecast of the future, the vast majority of media consumption will be via the internet.⁸ However, he also told us that, in his December speech, he had been deliberately provocative, and that his speech had also been somewhat misreported. He stressed that “I didn’t say we are going fully digital by the 2030s”.⁹ He also stressed the BBC’s strategic desire to maintain universality and that the BBC was not actively setting a date for a switchover. He said that the BBC understood how many people relied on DTT (Digital Terrestrial Television) and it would be “an act of self-harm to cut people off from the BBC.”¹⁰

8. BBC Three was taken off air as a traditional linear broadcast channel and was made an internet-only channel in 2016. Six years later that decision was reversed on the grounds of it having reduced the BBC’s impact with younger audiences, particularly those who still watched broadcast TV.¹¹ We raised this, and the BBC acknowledged that “We went a bit early” and that while it might be easy to go to digital, “you can go to digital and be a lot smaller quite fast”.¹²

9. The BBC also acknowledged the four recommendations in the NAO report, one of which was to build on its December 2022 announcement and plan scenarios for how it could move between broadcast and internet services in the future. It said that those recommendations were extremely helpful, appropriately challenging, and that it had been working hard on them.¹³

10. We raised the question of education for people, typically older people, who are not familiar or confident with adopting what may be new technology to them. The BBC stressed its universality obligation to ensure that content is accessible. It also said it was critical that there was focus and prioritisation of its limited resources to ensure it continued to serve all its audiences, young and old.¹⁴ The BBC told us it had a huge role to play in education,

6 C&AG’s Report, paras 3, 1.2

7 C&AG’s Report, para 1.19

8 Q 23

9 Qq 24, 25

10 Qq 36, 45

11 C&AG’s Report, para 1.18

12 Q 68

13 Q 91; C&AG’s Report, para 20

14 Q 44

commenting that people tend to trust the BBC, and that it would have a lot of services for getting older populations to engage. It said that education would have to be part of the transition through the 2030s “and for as long as it takes”.¹⁵

11. Good quality access to online services will rely of course on the roll-out of broadband, overseen by the Department for Digital, Culture, Media & Sport. We noted that the BBC’s universal service commitments could not be met with current broadband provision.¹⁶ The BBC highlighted that with a perfect broadband service, audiences could get much better functionality than with traditional broadcast TV.¹⁷ But broadband roll-out is of course a much wider issue than just concerning the BBC and the BBC is not responsible for any of the build out. The BBC also said that affordability of broadband, that is the cost to households of purchasing contracts, was an issue.¹⁸ Shortly after our session with the BBC we took evidence from the Department on a range of matters, including progress with gigabit broadband roll-out. It acknowledged that the roll-out is critical to the BBC’s plans for an internet-only future, that discussions were already in train and it will expect to have further discussions on it as part of the charter renewal. We will continue to keep a close eye on progress, in particular for providing people living in harder to reach areas with decent broadband coverage.¹⁹

Funding the digital strategy

12. Following its January 2022 licence fee settlement with government, the BBC estimated that it would have a funding gap of £285 million a year by 2027–28, and that it needs to deliver £500 million of annual savings and reinvestment to achieve its digital-first ambitions. This funding gap was calculated on the basis of the licence fee being held flat in 2022–23 and 2023–24 with no links to inflation, followed by four years linked to inflation.²⁰ The BBC told us that with inflation the funding gap had now risen from £285 million to nearly £400 million, on top of its funding having reduced in real-terms by 30% over the last 10 years.²¹

13. The BBC’s spending on its product development has also declined, from £109 million in 2018–19 to £98 million in 2021–22 (in 2021–22 prices). However, due to the renewed focus on the growth of its digital products, the BBC has budgeted £116 million to spend within its product group in 2022–23 (in 2021–22 prices). This includes an extra £10 million announced as part of its digital-first plans through to 2025. After this, the BBC expects to invest up to an additional £50 million a year into transforming its use of data, personalisation and user experience.²²

14. The BBC’s spending on digital product development is far lower than many other media organisations, many of which are digital-only, though direct spending comparisons are problematic. Additionally, the BBC has a range of universal service obligations that other media firms do not, and provides a range of services that its digital-only competitors

15 Q 45

16 Q 29

17 Q 24

18 Qq 29, 30

19 Public Accounts Committee, *Oral evidence: DCMS Recall: Broadband, Gambling and Unboxed*, HC 1052. Monday 23 January 2023

20 C&AG’s Report, para 2.2

21 Qq 6, 51

22 Q 37; C&AG’s Report, para 2.4

do not, such as local radio and educational programming. Nevertheless, the BBC is seeking to attract the same audiences as other media providers and has significantly lower funding for developing its digital products. The BBC estimates that its technology product development spending is equivalent to 2.8% of its revenue, whereas its competitors typically spend around 8%–11%. In 2021, for example, Netflix spent £1.7 billion on technology and development. The BBC has therefore not been able to develop its product portfolio with the same pace and sophistication as that of rival media organisations.²³

15. In May 2022, the BBC announced a £500 million investment plan, in support of its digital-first ambitions. The BBC plans for this to come from £200 million a year in spending reductions as well as £300 million a year from redistributing money within the organisation and increased commercial income.²⁴

16. We asked whether the BBC considered £500 million would be enough for its investment plan. The BBC said that pressure on the £500 million had increased and it would have to “box very clever”.²⁵ It said it had already taken some tough decisions, it would have to focus, and stop things that are less effective. For example, it was making 12,000 hours of content now compared to 13,000 a few years ago.²⁶ But the BBC acknowledged that “we do not know if it is enough” and that it would be “incredibly difficult”. The BBC commented that it would have to find ways of attracting more capital from its commercial arm, and also agreed that it did not want to find savings by doing things that would be acts of self-harm, such as closing lots of radio stations. The BBC also said that the strategic technology review had enabled it to pull departments together, realising economies of scale and also improving performance.²⁷

17. On financial plans, the BBC also said it thought it would have to find ways of attracting more capital into its technology investment.²⁸ But it made clear that there is no plan in the UK to add subscription services, as people have already paid the licence fee.²⁹

18. We raised a concern about the lack of sufficient detail to support the BBC’s digital investment plan, for example around how savings will be achieved, what happens if savings targets are not met, or whether additional borrowing would be required.³⁰ The BBC said it was helpful to have had those points highlighted. It told us that it was working through the budgeting process and building detailed budget plans, and that the budget process it was currently in would refine the detail.³¹ The BBC also highlighted that it did not have the same ability as its commercial competitors to raise debt to fund its digital ambitions. On the other hand, it did have the security and stability of the licence fee, at least to the end of the charter period.³²

23 C&AG’s Report, paras 10, 2.5

24 C&AG’s Report, para 2.6

25 Q 51

26 Qq 37, 51, 52

27 Qq 52, 53

28 Q 38

29 Qq 41, 42

30 Q 55; C&AG’s Report, paras 11, 20

31 Qq 43, 55

32 Q 55

2 People and data

Staff recruitment and retention

19. Although the BBC has managed to successfully recruit and retain a number of highly skilled individuals to lead its digital teams, overall it has a shortage of specialist digital staff. In common with other organisations, the BBC has experienced technology staffing shortages and high turnover of staff. This is partly due to the BBC’s pay levels being lower than some other potential employers for technology professionals. This is despite the BBC keeping its pay ranges under regular review, including by benchmarking these against wider industry pay levels.³³ The BBC told us that it had increased the pay ranges for some of its digital jobs by more than the standard pay rise agreed last year for the majority of its employees.³⁴

20. The product group in the BBC—responsible for developing and delivering the BBC’s audience-facing digital products—accounts for 5.7% of the total BBC public service pay bill.³⁵ In its product group the BBC had 23% staff turnover as of June 2022. This high number of vacancies has slowed technical development. The number of vacancies in the search team, for example, has hindered the BBC’s ability to develop its search function further.³⁶

21. The BBC told us that last year had been really difficult for attracting people. It cited the particular consequences of the covid pandemic for the technology market, with international organisations starting to offer remote working contracts, giving potential employees, for example in the Salford area, more options, with salaries rising fast, and recruitment happening at a faster pace. The BBC said it was in a much better position this year compared to last, with attrition trending down and recruitment having sped up and grown. Nevertheless, it acknowledged it was a real fight to get enough of the right people with the right skills.³⁷

22. The BBC considered there may be an increasing sense developing of people wanting to ‘reconnect with purpose’ and of that being a material consideration for people when choosing who they wished to work for; implying that the BBC could benefit from that sort of preference.³⁸ The BBC stressed how it can offer something unique for people in terms of what they could do with their career, the range of products, and the appeal of working for an organisation with the BBC’s public service mission and purpose.³⁹ It noted how the BBC does not have a competitor producing the same breadth and type of content.⁴⁰ It also said it needed to make sure that the BBC is not seen as a bureaucratic place to come and work.⁴¹ However, and in the context of discussing how stretched the overall budget for digital investment will be, the BBC also acknowledged that “We are going to need to attract brilliant people at a massive discount to the market.”⁴²

33 C&AG’s Report, para 2.11

34 Q 87

35 Letter dated 25 January 2023 from Tim Davie, BBC Director General, to PAC Chair; C&AG’s Report, para 6

36 C&AG’s Report, para 2.11

37 Qq 84, 98

38 Q 98

39 Qq 84, 85

40 Q 58

41 Q 98

42 Q 37

Personalised services

23. Over the past nine years, the BBC has signalled that it sees offering a more personalised experience as important to its future plans and key to this is sign-in, whereby users register for and use a BBC account to access digital services. In September 2021, it produced a sign-in strategy, with a target for 72% of digital product views to come from signed-in users by 2023. It also has an overall goal of having 20.2 million weekly average signed-in users by 2022, growing to 23.5 million users by 2023. BBC Online’s signed-in accounts increased from 14.6 million on average per week in 2019–20 to 18.1 million in 2021–22. This continued to grow and reached 19.6 million signed-in accounts in June 2022.⁴³

24. Through sign-in, the BBC can collect personal information about its users to understand their preferences. When used alongside recommendation algorithms, this should provide a user experience tailored to their individual preferences. The BBC does not believe that it is possible to compete digitally without knowing users’ viewing habits. However, while the BBC has started to develop plans for how it could personalise some of its individual digital products and services such as iPlayer, it has yet to show that it has begun work on pulling together a comprehensive strategy for personalisation across the organisation.⁴⁴

25. The BBC told us that it tried to make the sign-up process as simple as possible, while at the same time giving the user control, and was very conscious of accessibility and different digital familiarity levels.⁴⁵ The BBC described to us how it was vital to help users find what they were looking for as easily as possible, and that it used data to match users to content and so tried to provide the best kind of shortcut connection.⁴⁶ It said there was a mix of how it made recommendations to users; with human-selected and curated stories and also algorithmically recommended content.⁴⁷

26. The BBC also told us that it needed to build something different to a commercial algorithm, saying that there are many commercial models that lead you to where you do not want to be. Whereas, the BBC also has its public service values, and wants to educate and entertain. “We are going to have to get a very careful balance, and this is a very interesting challenge. It is different ... and no one in the world has done it, by the way.”⁴⁸

Data security

27. To build a more personalised experience for its users, the BBC will need to increase its use of their personal data. The BBC plans to use these data to support commissioning decisions and to make tailored content recommendations, and needs to meet best practice and transparency in data-handling. There is potential for reputational damage if the BBC does not meet best practice in acquiring, storing and securing personal data, and being transparent about its use. In 2019, a BBC-commissioned report found it was only in the early stages of maturity in compliance with data protection legislation in its use of

43 C&AG’s Report, paras 8, 1.14

44 C&AG’s Report, paras 8, 1.14

45 Q 75

46 Q 59

47 Q 63

48 Q 62

audience data. The BBC has since improved its approach to users' data and data protection, including appointing a data protection officer and creating a central Data Protection Office team in 2019.⁴⁹

28. The BBC told us it had no plans to commercialise the data it holds on viewers, assuring us categorically that it had no plans to use or sell UK subscriber data to any other party for commercial purposes. It said that it collected the least amount of personal data that it could on sign-up, and that it did then collect data at an aggregated level and on an anonymised basis as people used products, so that it could see what was being used and to what extent. But that it does not share or sell that data or have any plans to.⁵⁰ The BBC acknowledged that it would be collecting a lot more information from a lot more people as it expanded its digital output.⁵¹

29. The BBC welcomed the recommendations made by the NAO which included on managing potential data risk and said it was taking action on oversight and policy. It outlined some actions taken in recent years to improve its approach, stressed that these things were key parts of the organisation, and that development of governance in this respect was crucial to make sure the BBC did not breach its data regulations.⁵² While it would inevitably be collecting more data in future, the BBC felt the framework it had in place meant it was in a good position to mitigate any risk.⁵³ However, in reviewing BBC planning documents on using customer data the NAO found no references to its approach to the management and mitigation of reputational and other potential risks that could arise as it increases its use of such data.⁵⁴

30. The BBC told us it has had no data breaches that it has had to report to the Information Commissioner's Office (ICO) this financial year. It has reported 27 data breaches since April 2020 and told us that the ICO had not taken any enforcement action against the BBC in relation to any of those cases. The BBC assured us that it monitors and manages all data incidents very carefully and that it raises incidents when it needs to.⁵⁵

49 C&AG's Report, para 17

50 Qq 72, 74

51 Q 91

52 Q 91

53 Q 92

54 C&AG's Report, para 17

55 Qq 93–95; Letter dated 13 January from Leigh Tavaziva, BBC Group Chief Operating Officer, to PAC Chair

Formal minutes

Monday 20 March 2023

Members present:

Dame Meg Hillier

Olivia Blake

Dan Carden

Mr Jonathan Djanogly

Mrs Flick Drummon

Peter Grant

Anne Marie Morris

Nick Smith

BBC digital

Draft Report (*BBC digital*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

Ordered, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 30 read and agreed to.

Summary agreed to.

Introduction agreed to.

Conclusions and recommendations agreed to.

Resolved, That the Report be the Forty-sixth of the Committee to the House.

Ordered, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

Adjournment

Adjourned till Thursday 23 March at 9.30am.

Witnesses

The following witnesses gave evidence. Transcripts can be viewed on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

Monday 12 January 2023

Tim Davie CBE, Director-General, BBC; **Storm Fagan**, Chief Product Officer, BBC; and **Leigh Tavaziva**, Chief Operating Officer, BBC

[Q1-98](#)

Published written evidence

The following written evidence was received and can be viewed on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

BCD numbers are generated by the evidence processing system and so may not be complete.

- 1 Jackson, Professor Philip (Professor of Machine Listening, Centre for Vision Speech & Signal Processing (CVSSP), University of Surrey) ([BCD0002](#))
- 2 News Media Association ([BCD0003](#))
- 3 Simon, Felix M. (Leverhulme Doctoral Scholar, Oxford Internet Institute, University of Oxford) ([BCD0001](#))

List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

All publications from the Committee are available on the [publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

Session 2022–23

Number	Title	Reference
1st	Department for Business, Energy & Industrial Strategy Annual Report and Accounts 2020–21	HC 59
2nd	Lessons from implementing IR35 reforms	HC 60
3rd	The future of the Advanced Gas-cooled Reactors	HC 118
4th	Use of evaluation and modelling in government	HC 254
5th	Local economic growth	HC 252
6th	Department of Health and Social Care 2020–21 Annual Report and Accounts	HC 253
7th	Armoured Vehicles: the Ajax programme	HC 259
8th	Financial sustainability of the higher education sector in England	HC 257
9th	Child Maintenance	HC 255
10th	Restoration and Renewal of Parliament	HC 49
11th	The rollout of the COVID-19 vaccine programme in England	HC 258
12th	Management of PPE contracts	HC 260
13th	Secure training centres and secure schools	HC 30
14th	Investigation into the British Steel Pension Scheme	HC 251
15th	The Police Uplift Programme	HC 261
16th	Managing cross-border travel during the COVID-19 pandemic	HC 29
17th	Government's contracts with Radox Laboratories Ltd	HC 28
18th	Government actions to combat waste crime	HC 33
19th	Regulating after EU Exit	HC 32
20th	Whole of Government Accounts 2019–20	HC 31
21st	Transforming electronic monitoring services	HC 34
22nd	Tackling local air quality breaches	HC 37
23rd	Measuring and reporting public sector greenhouse gas emissions	HC 39
24th	Redevelopment of Defra's animal health infrastructure	HC 42
25th	Regulation of energy suppliers	HC 41
26th	The Department for Work and Pensions' Accounts 2021–22 – Fraud and error in the benefits system	HC 44
27th	Evaluating innovation projects in children's social care	HC 38

Number	Title	Reference
28th	Improving the Accounting Officer Assessment process	HC 43
29th	The Affordable Homes Programme since 2015	HC 684
30th	Developing workforce skills for a strong economy	HC 685
31st	Managing central government property	HC 48
32nd	Grassroots participation in sport and physical activity	HC 46
33rd	HMRC performance in 2021–22	HC 686
34th	The Creation of the UK Infrastructure Bank	HC 45
35th	Introducing Integrated Care Systems	HC 47
36th	The Defence digital strategy	HC 727
37th	Support for vulnerable adolescents	HC 730
38th	Managing NHS backlogs and waiting times in England	HC 729
39th	Excess Votes 2021–22	HC 1132
40th	COVID employment support schemes	HC 810
41st	Driving licence backlogs at the DVLA	HC 735
42nd	The Restart Scheme for long-term unemployed people	HC 733
43rd	Progress combatting fraud	HC 40
44th	The Digital Services Tax	HC 732
45th	Department for Business, Energy & Industrial Strategy Annual Report and Accounts 2021–22	HC 1254
47th	Investigation into the UK Passport Office	HC 738
48th	MoD Equipment Plan 2022–2032	HC 731
1st Special Report	Sixth Annual Report of the Chair of the Committee of Public Accounts	HC 50

Session 2021–22

Number	Title	Reference
1st	Low emission cars	HC 186
2nd	BBC strategic financial management	HC 187
3rd	COVID-19: Support for children's education	HC 240
4th	COVID-19: Local government finance	HC 239
5th	COVID-19: Government Support for Charities	HC 250
6th	Public Sector Pensions	HC 289
7th	Adult Social Care Markets	HC 252
8th	COVID 19: Culture Recovery Fund	HC 340
9th	Fraud and Error	HC 253
10th	Overview of the English rail system	HC 170

Number	Title	Reference
11th	Local auditor reporting on local government in England	HC 171
12th	COVID 19: Cost Tracker Update	HC 173
13th	Initial lessons from the government's response to the COVID-19 pandemic	HC 175
14th	Windrush Compensation Scheme	HC 174
15th	DWP Employment support	HC 177
16th	Principles of effective regulation	HC 176
17th	High Speed 2: Progress at Summer 2021	HC 329
18th	Government's delivery through arm's-length bodies	HC 181
19th	Protecting consumers from unsafe products	HC 180
20th	Optimising the defence estate	HC 179
21st	School Funding	HC 183
22nd	Improving the performance of major defence equipment contracts	HC 185
23rd	Test and Trace update	HC 182
24th	Crossrail: A progress update	HC 184
25th	The Department for Work and Pensions' Accounts 2020–21 – Fraud and error in the benefits system	HC 633
26th	Lessons from Greensill Capital: accreditation to business support schemes	HC 169
27th	Green Homes Grant Voucher Scheme	HC 635
28th	Efficiency in government	HC 636
29th	The National Law Enforcement Data Programme	HC 638
30th	Challenges in implementing digital change	HC 637
31st	Environmental Land Management Scheme	HC 639
32nd	Delivering gigabitcapable broadband	HC 743
33rd	Underpayments of the State Pension	HC 654
34th	Local Government Finance System: Overview and Challenges	HC 646
35th	The pharmacy early payment and salary advance schemes in the NHS	HC 745
36th	EU Exit: UK Border post transition	HC 746
37th	HMRC Performance in 2020–21	HC 641
38th	COVID-19 cost tracker update	HC 640
39th	DWP Employment Support: Kickstart Scheme	HC 655
40th	Excess votes 2020–21: Serious Fraud Office	HC 1099
41st	Achieving Net Zero: Follow up	HC 642
42nd	Financial sustainability of schools in England	HC 650
43rd	Reducing the backlog in criminal courts	HC 643

Number	Title	Reference
44th	NHS backlogs and waiting times in England	HC 747
45th	Progress with trade negotiations	HC 993
46th	Government preparedness for the COVID-19 pandemic: lessons for government on risk	HC 952
47th	Academies Sector Annual Report and Accounts 2019/20	HC 994
48th	HMRC's management of tax debt	HC 953
49th	Regulation of private renting	HC 996
50th	Bounce Back Loans Scheme: Follow-up	HC 951
51st	Improving outcomes for women in the criminal justice system	HC 997
52nd	Ministry of Defence Equipment Plan 2021–31	HC 1164
1st Special Report	Fifth Annual Report of the Chair of the Committee of Public Accounts	HC 222

Session 2019–21

Number	Title	Reference
1st	Support for children with special educational needs and disabilities	HC 85
2nd	Defence Nuclear Infrastructure	HC 86
3rd	High Speed 2: Spring 2020 Update	HC 84
4th	EU Exit: Get ready for Brexit Campaign	HC 131
5th	University technical colleges	HC 87
6th	Excess votes 2018–19	HC 243
7th	Gambling regulation: problem gambling and protecting vulnerable people	HC 134
8th	NHS capital expenditure and financial management	HC 344
9th	Water supply and demand management	HC 378
10th	Defence capability and the Equipment Plan	HC 247
11th	Local authority investment in commercial property	HC 312
12th	Management of tax reliefs	HC 379
13th	Whole of Government Response to COVID-19	HC 404
14th	Readying the NHS and social care for the COVID-19 peak	HC 405
15th	Improving the prison estate	HC 244
16th	Progress in remediating dangerous cladding	HC 406
17th	Immigration enforcement	HC 407
18th	NHS nursing workforce	HC 408
19th	Restoration and renewal of the Palace of Westminster	HC 549

Number	Title	Reference
20th	Tackling the tax gap	HC 650
21st	Government support for UK exporters	HC 679
22nd	Digital transformation in the NHS	HC 680
23rd	Delivering carrier strike	HC 684
24th	Selecting towns for the Towns Fund	HC 651
25th	Asylum accommodation and support transformation programme	HC 683
26th	Department of Work and Pensions Accounts 2019–20	HC 681
27th	Covid-19: Supply of ventilators	HC 685
28th	The Nuclear Decommissioning Authority's management of the Magnox contract	HC 653
29th	Whitehall preparations for EU Exit	HC 682
30th	The production and distribution of cash	HC 654
31st	Starter Homes	HC 88
32nd	Specialist Skills in the civil service	HC 686
33rd	Covid-19: Bounce Back Loan Scheme	HC 687
34th	Covid-19: Support for jobs	HC 920
35th	Improving Broadband	HC 688
36th	HMRC performance 2019–20	HC 690
37th	Whole of Government Accounts 2018–19	HC 655
38th	Managing colleges' financial sustainability	HC 692
39th	Lessons from major projects and programmes	HC 694
40th	Achieving government's long-term environmental goals	HC 927
41st	COVID 19: the free school meals voucher scheme	HC 689
42nd	COVID-19: Government procurement and supply of Personal Protective Equipment	HC 928
43rd	COVID-19: Planning for a vaccine Part 1	HC 930
44th	Excess Votes 2019–20	HC 1205
45th	Managing flood risk	HC 931
46th	Achieving Net Zero	HC 935
47th	COVID-19: Test, track and trace (part 1)	HC 932
48th	Digital Services at the Border	HC 936
49th	COVID-19: housing people sleeping rough	HC 934
50th	Defence Equipment Plan 2020–2030	HC 693
51st	Managing the expiry of PFI contracts	HC 1114
52nd	Key challenges facing the Ministry of Justice	HC 1190
53rd	Covid 19: supporting the vulnerable during lockdown	HC 938

Number	Title	Reference
54th	Improving single living accommodation for service personnel	HC 940
55th	Environmental tax measures	HC 937
56th	Industrial Strategy Challenge Fund	HC 941