

THE HOUSE OF COMMONS COMMISSION

Lay Members of the Committee on Standards: Nomination of Candidates

Report presented to the House of Commons by the Speaker

Ordered by The House of Commons to be printed 22 July 2020

Commissioners

The Speaker (Sir Lindsay Hoyle) (Chair), The Leader of the House of Commons (Jacob Rees-Mogg), Valerie Vaz, Sir Charles Walker, Dame Rosie Winterton, Pete Wishart, Dr John Benger (Clerk of the House), Ian Ailles (Director General), Jane McCall (External member) and Dr Rima Makarem (External member).

Secretary to the Commission: Marianne Cwynarski.

Assistant Secretary: Robert Cope.

HOUSE OF COMMONS COMMISSION

Lay Members of the Committee on Standards: Nomination of Candidates

Introduction

1. In 2009 the Committee on Standards in Public Life recommended:

“There should be at least two lay members who have never been Parliamentarians on the Standards and Privileges Committee. Their appointment should be made in the same way as that of the lay members of the Speaker’s Committee of the independent regulator.”¹

2. On 2 December 2010 the House agreed to the principle of lay members, and invited the Procedure Committee to bring forward proposals to implement it.² Those proposals, with some slight modifications, were given effect by the House on 12 March 2012 when Standing Orders No. 148A and 149A were made and Standing Order No. 149 was amended. On 13 December 2012 the House appointed three lay members to the Committee on Standards. Further amendments to Standing Orders in March 2015 increased the number of lay members on the Committee to seven, establishing an equal balance of lay and elected members on the Committee. The four additional lay members were appointed by the House on 19 May 2016.
3. The terms of office of the first tranche of lay members came to an end on 30 March 2017, and on 15 March 2017 three further lay members were appointed by the House to replace them.
4. Two of the four lay members recruited in 2016 came to the end of their four-year terms on 18 May 2020 (the other two had been appointed for six-year terms). In February 2020 the House of Commons Commission agreed a recruitment process to replace them. In line with the requirement in Standing Order No. 149A, the process was designed to be open and fair.

1 Twelfth Report from the Committee on Standards in Public Life, *MPs’ Expenses and Allowances*, Cm 7244

2 Sixth Report from the Procedure Committee, Session 2010–12, *Lay membership of the Committee on Standards and Privileges*, HC 1606, and the Government Response, Third Special Report from the Procedure Committee, Session 2010–12, HC 1689

5. The two posts were advertised on the Parliamentary website, through the Outreach Service, through social media and through advertisement and search by recruitment consultants. There were 331 applicants. These were reduced through sifts and interviews to a short list of ten for final interview in May 2020 by a Selection Panel comprising Jane McCall (external member of the House of Commons Commission and Chair of the selection panel), Kate Green MP (former Chair of the Committee on Standards), Mark Hutton (Clerk of the Journals) and Dr Arun Midha (lay member of the Committee on Standards).
6. Kate Green was Chair of the Standards Committee when the panel began its work in February 2020; following her appointment in April to the Opposition front bench, she ceased to be committee chair on 6 May; in the interests of continuity, and by agreement with her successor, Chris Bryant MP, she remained on the panel to participate in the final stages of its work.
7. The Selection Panel made a report to the Commission, recommending two candidates for appointment. The panel further recommended that the new appointments should be for a term of six years.

The nominated candidates

8. Following the exacting process set out above, the House of Commons Commission proposes the following two candidates to the House, to serve for a term of six years:
 - Ms Melanie Carter
 - Professor Michael Maguire CBE
9. The two candidates represent a combination of experience and qualities which should reinforce public confidence in the independent element in the House's disciplinary processes.

The outgoing lay members

10. The Commission would also like to take this opportunity to express the thanks of the House to the outgoing lay members, Miss Charmaine Burton and Sir Peter Rubin, for the significant contribution they have made to the Committee on Standards and to the standards system in the House more widely.

ANNEX – BRIEF DETAILS OF NOMINATED CANDIDATES

MS MELANIE CARTER

Current roles

Senior Partner and Head of Public and Regulatory Law Dept, Bates Wells, Solicitors

Independent Adjudicator, Marine Stewardship Council

Tribunal Judge – First Tier Tribunal (Information Rights)

Founder member of Public Law Solicitors Association

Previous employment

Partner, Public Law Team, DMH Stallard, Solicitors	2005–08
Solicitor, Bindmans	2004–05
Director of Standards, Deputy Registrar, General Optical Council	2003–04
Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw, Solicitors	1997–2003
Government Legal Service	1990–97
(Home Office, Treasury Solicitor's Department, Commission for Racial Equality (secondment to Health & Safety Executive))	
Barrister (tenant at New Court Chambers)	1988–90
Housing Action Centre, co-ordinator and caseworker	1985–88
Blackfriars Advice Centre, welfare rights caseworker	1984–85

Previous public appointments

Independent member, Brighton & Hove Council Standards Committee	2006–11
Legal Chair, Adjudication Panel for England	2002–10
Magistrate (London, South West bench)	1997–99

Educational qualifications

Law Society	Admitted as Solicitor	1998
Middle Temple	Called to the Bar	1984
Downing College, Cambridge	BA Law 2:1	1983

Voluntary work

Advice Centre in the Blue – volunteer welfare rights adviser	1984–85
Rights of Women – volunteer	1985–87
Founder ABNA phone line for eating disorder sufferers	1985–86
Founder member, Kensington & Chelsea Race and Housing Group	1986–88
Womens Aid – trustee Board member	1986–88
Crisis (homeless charity)	1990–92
Central London Law Centre – Management Committee (Vice Chair)	1992–94
Brighton & Hove, Community & Voluntary Service Council, trustee	2014–15
Public Law Project, Vice Chair (trustee)	2016–18
B-eat (eating disorders charity) (trustee)	2018–19

PROFESSOR MICHAEL MAGUIRE CBE

Professional experience

Police Ombudsman for Northern Ireland	2012–19
Chief Inspector of Criminal Justice, Northern Ireland	2008–12
Partner, PA Consulting Group	1998–2008
Senior Consultant, Managing Consultant & Director, Price Waterhouse Management Consultants	1990–98
Research Officer, University of Aston, Birmingham, and The Queen's University & University of Ulster, Belfast	1985–90

Other roles

Chairman of the Northern Ireland Division, Institute of Directors	2004–06
Member of Prison Reform Group set up by Minister of Justice to oversee implementation of Owers Report into the Northern Ireland Prison Service	2011–12
Member of change management board, Independent Police Complaints Commission	2013–14
Adjunct Visiting Professor (Practice), Monash University, Melbourne, Australia	2019 to present
Honorary Professor, Senator George J. Mitchell Institute for Global Peace, Security & Justice	2019 to present

Educational qualifications

Bachelor of Social Science (Hons.), Second Class, First Division, The Queen's University of Belfast	1981
Doctor of Philosophy (By Thesis), The Queen's University of Belfast	1985

Awards

Awarded a CBE in the Birthday Honours list	2019
--	------