



House of Commons
Justice Committee

Appointment of HM Chief Inspector of Prisons

Eighth Report of Session 2019–21

*Report, together with formal minutes relating
to the report*

*Ordered by the House of Commons
to be printed 15 September 2020*

HC 750

Published on 17 September 2020
by authority of the House of Commons

Justice Committee

The Justice Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration and policy of the Ministry of Justice and its associated public bodies (including the work of staff provided for the administrative work of courts and tribunals, but excluding consideration of individual cases and appointments, and excluding the work of the Scotland and Wales Offices and of the Advocate General for Scotland); and administration and expenditure of the Attorney General's Office, the Treasury Solicitor's Department, the Crown Prosecution Service and the Serious Fraud Office (but excluding individual cases and appointments and advice given within government by Law Officers).

Current membership

[Sir Robert Neill MP](#) (*Conservative, Bromley and Chislehurst*) (Chair)

[Paula Barker MP](#) (*Labour, Liverpool, Wavertree*)

[Richard Burgon MP](#) (*Labour, Leeds East*)

[Rob Butler MP](#) (*Conservative, Aylesbury*)

[James Daly MP](#) (*Conservative, Bury North*)

[Sarah Dines MP](#) (*Conservative, Derbyshire Dales*)

[Maria Eagle MP](#) (*Labour, Garston and Halewood*)

[John Howell MP](#) (*Conservative, Henley*)

[Kenny MacAskill MP](#) (*Scottish National Party, East Lothian*)

[Kieran Mullan MP](#) (*Conservative, Crewe and Nantwich*)

[Andy Slaughter MP](#) (*Labour, Hammersmith*)

The following were also Members of the Committee during this session.

[Ellie Reeves MP](#) (*Labour, Lewisham West and Penge*) and [Ms Marie Rimmer MP](#) (*Labour, St Helens South and Whiston*)

Powers

© Parliamentary Copyright House of Commons 2019. This publication may be reproduced under the terms of the Open Parliament Licence, which is published at www.parliament.uk/copyright.

The Committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No 152. These are available on the internet via www.parliament.uk.

Publication

Committee reports are published on the Committee's website at www.parliament.uk/justicecommittee and in print by Order of the House.

Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are Nony Ardill (Legal Specialist), Chloë Cockett (Senior Specialist), Mark Doyle (Committee Media Officer), Seb Newman (Second Clerk), Su Panchanathan (Committee Assistant), Tracey Payne (Committee Specialist), Christine Randall (Senior Committee Assistant), Jack Simson Caird (Assistant Counsel), Holly Tremain (Committee Specialist), and David Weir (Clerk).

Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Justice Committee, House of Commons, London SW1A 0AA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 8196; the Committee's email address is justicecom@parliament.uk.

You can follow the Committee on Twitter using [@CommonsJustice](https://twitter.com/CommonsJustice)

Contents

Report	3
HM Chief Inspector of Prisons	3
The recruitment process	4
Role and person specification	4
Charlie Taylor, the preferred candidate	5
Conclusion	5
Annexe A: Posts which are subject to pre-appointment hearings before the Justice Committee	6
Appendix A: Correspondence between the Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice and the Chair	7
Letter from Rt Hon David Gauke MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice, dated 12 June 2019	7
Letter from Rt Hon Robert Buckland QC MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice, dated 6 May 2020	10
Reply from Sir Robert Neill MP, Chair, Justice Committee, dated 13 May 2020	14
Response from Rt Hon Robert Buckland QC MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice, dated 19 May 2020	14
Letter from Rt Hon Robert Buckland QC MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice, dated 5 August 2020	15
Appendix B: Information about the recruitment campaign	17
Appendix C: Job Advertisement	19
Appendix D: Curriculum vitae – Charlie Taylor	22
Witnesses	25
Formal minutes	26
List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament	27

Report

HM Chief Inspector of Prisons

1. The role of HM Chief Inspector of Prisons (HMCIP) was established by the Criminal Justice Act 1982. It is a Crown appointment, made from outside the Prison Service on the advice of the Justice Secretary. The Chief Inspector is head of HM Inspectorate of Prisons (HMIP), an Arm's Length Body of the Ministry of Justice (MoJ). HMIP is an independent inspectorate that reports on conditions for and the treatment of prisoners in England and Wales. Its remit is primarily set out in section 5A of the Prison Act 1952, and also includes the inspection of young offender institutions and secure training centres in England and Wales; all forms of immigration detention throughout the UK and overseas escorts; police custody in England and Wales; court custody in England and Wales; and Border Force custody in England and Scotland. By invitation, HMIP may also inspect military detention facilities throughout the UK, prisons in Northern Ireland, and prisons and custodial institutions in other jurisdictions with links to the UK. Most HMIP inspections take place in partnership with other inspectorates, including HM Inspectorate of Constabulary and Fire and Rescue Services, the Care Quality Commission, HM Inspectorate of Probation, Ofsted, Estyn and the General Pharmaceutical Council, appropriate to the type and location of the establishment.

2. HMIP's statement of purpose is "to ensure independent inspection of places of detention, report on conditions and treatment, and promote positive outcomes for those detained and the public." The Inspectorate undertakes inspections according to its own methodology and published assessment criteria (termed "Expectations"). These are based on international human rights standards, as well as issues considered essential to the safe, respectful and purposeful treatment of detainees in custody and their effective resettlement. Expectations are also based on the rules, regulations, and guidelines by which a type of custodial establishment is run (for example, with reference to prisons the Inspectorate considers Prison Service orders and standards). The main products of HMIP's work are inspection reports, which are published and normally include recommendations for action.

3. The work of HMIP is informed by five value statements, that: independent, impartiality and integrity are the foundations of their work; the experience of the detainee is at the heart of their inspections; respect for human rights underpins their Expectations; they embrace diversity and are committed to pursuing equality of outcomes for all; and they believe in the capacity of both individuals and organisations to change and improve, and that they have a part to play in initiating and encouraging change.¹

4. These values reflect HMIP's role as both a member and co-ordinator of the UK's National Preventive Mechanism (NPM), a collective of 21 visiting and inspecting bodies. It was established in 2009 to ensure regular visits to places of detention in order to prevent torture and other ill-treatment. The NPM's establishment is required under the Optional Protocol to the UN Convention Against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (OPCAT), an international human rights treaty that the UK ratified in 2003.

1 HM Inspectorate of Prisons, '[Our values and equality and diversity statement](#)', accessed 8 September 2020.

5. The Inspectorate's budget in 2018-19 was £4.6 million, of which 79% came directly from the MoJ, with the rest of its funding provided by the other bodies responsible for the services it inspects, such as the Home Office and the Youth Justice Board and Youth Justice Commissioning Team.² The Chief Inspector is supported by a Deputy Chief Inspector and, as at the end of 2018-19, a team of 78 staff, including inspectors, researchers, administrators and other fee-paid staff.³

The recruitment process

6. The campaign to recruit the next HM Chief Inspector of Prisons was originally launched in July 2019 (under the then Justice Secretary, David Gauke). Changes to the MoJ Ministerial team and the 2019 General Election disrupted the campaign's progress, though interviews were held in October 2019. It was announced in January 2020 that the tenure of the existing Chief Inspector, Peter Clarke, had been extended until the end of April.⁴ The recruitment campaign concluded in April without an appointment being made, and it was announced that Peter Clarke's tenure had been further extended by up to six months.⁵

7. In a letter to the Committee on 6 May, the Justice Secretary, Robert Buckland, explained that he had not been satisfied that the role description and criteria used in the recruitment campaign fully reflected the aims of the Inspectorate, and consequently he had not made an appointment and was re-launching the campaign with new criteria. The relevant correspondence is appended to this report.⁶ The MoJ subsequently advertised the role of Chief Inspector between 20 May and 15 June on the Cabinet Office and The Times websites, NEDonBoard and Women on Boards. Interviews were held in July, and on 6 August the Lord Chancellor wrote to inform us that Charlie Taylor was his preferred candidate for the role. Further information about the recruitment process provided to us by the MoJ is appended to this Report.

Role and person specification

8. The role and person specification established by the MoJ for the role of HM Chief Inspector of prisons are as follows:

The essential criteria for this role were that candidates needed to demonstrate:

- Outstanding leadership skills and experience, including successfully managing people, resources and finances, balanced against demanding workloads;
- Significant stakeholder management skills, highly developed inter-personal and communication skills, and a track record of collaborative working with a range of key stakeholder such as other Government Departments and inspectorates;
- A proven ability to handle the media along with the ability to deliver difficult and challenging messages;

2 HM Chief Inspector of Prisons for England and Wales [Annual Report 2018–19](#)

3 [Ibid](#)

4 Gov.UK, 'Extension of Peter Clarke's tenure as HM Chief Inspector of Prisons', accessed 8 September 2020

5 Gov.UK, 'Extension of Peter Clarke's tenure as HM Chief Inspector of Prisons', accessed 8 September 2020

6 Appendix A

- An ability to drive forward cultural transformation;
- An ability to process and interpret complex information and to offer well developed analytical reasoning to inform judgements based on evidence; and
- An ability to provide strong insight into the health and educational needs of offenders, including those with additional needs and disabilities.

The following criteria, while not essential, were also taken into account by the selection panel:

- Additional relevant experience which is transferable to the running of a public body;
- An understanding, or experience, of the policy reform agenda, political and media landscape in which the Inspectorate works; and
- An understanding, or experience of the criminal justice and immigration system in the UK or comparable jurisdictions, or in a relevant area such as rehabilitation or reducing reoffending.

Charlie Taylor, the preferred candidate

9. The Secretary of State's preferred candidate, Charlie Taylor, has more than twenty-five years' experience in education. Between 1989 and 2011 he worked as a teacher and then a head teacher at schools for children with behavioural difficulties. In 2011 he was appointed as an expert advisor on children's behaviour to the government at the Department for Education. Between 2012 and 2015 he was CEO of the National College for Teaching and Leadership, an executive agency of the Department for Education. More recently, Mr Taylor has worked in youth justice. In September 2015 he was Commissioned by the then Lord Chancellor to conduct a review into the youth justice system in England and Wales, which was published in December 2016. Between April 2017 and March 2020 Mr Taylor was Chair of the Youth Justice Board, and from January to July 2019 he conducted an independent review into the use of pain inducing techniques in the youth secure estate. Since September 2019, Mr Taylor has worked as an advisor to the Department for Education on the development of new school-based behaviour hubs. Mr Taylor's full CV is set out in Appendix E.

10. We held a pre-appointment hearing with Mr Taylor on 15 September, during which we asked a range of questions bearing on his suitability for the role of HM Chief Inspector of Prisons.⁷ These included questions about the relevance of his experience and skills to the post, about his views on the principal challenges facing the prison system and the Inspectorate in the coming years, and on how he would ensure the independence of his office from any political or other pressures.

Conclusion

11. On the basis of the discussion during the pre-appointment hearing and of our consideration of his CV, we are satisfied that Charlie Taylor meets the criteria necessary to fulfil the role of HM Chief Inspector of Prisons and we endorse his appointment.

7 The transcript of the evidence session is available on the Committee's website.

Annexe A: Posts which are subject to pre- appointment hearings before the Justice Committee

Chair of the Independent Monitoring Authority

Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission

Chair of the Office for Legal Complaints

HM Chief Inspector of the Crown Prosecution Service

HM Chief Inspector of Prisons

HM Chief Inspector of Probation

Prisons and Probation Ombudsman

Appendix A: Correspondence between the Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice and the Chair

Letter from Rt Hon David Gauke MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice, dated 12 June 2019

RECRUITMENT OF HER MAJESTY'S CHIEF INSPECTOR OF PRISONS

I am writing to you to inform you of our plans to recruit the next Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons (HMCIP).

As you know, I am the Minister responsible for recommending the appointment, by Her Majesty, of the HMCIP, a public appointment that is subject to pre-appointment scrutiny by the Justice Committee.

In February, we announced Peter Clarke would be re-appointed as HMCIP for one year running from 1 February 2019 to 31 January 2020. I attach details of the recruitment exercise that will identify his successor. The post will be advertised on the Cabinet Office Public Appointments website.

I would be grateful if you could let me have any views you may have on the job description and role criteria by Friday 21 June. My officials will be in touch to agree a suitable date for the pre-appointment hearing.

RT HON DAVID GAUKE MP

Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons - Job description and essential criteria

Job description

Prisons and prisoner outcomes are high on the political and media agenda.

We are looking for an exceptional candidate to fill this significant statutory Crown appointment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons.

Reporting directly to Ministers, the successful candidate will have a proven ability to act with integrity and independence from Government, and the services under the Inspectorate's scrutiny.

The Inspectorate's methodology focuses on outcomes for those detained within the custodial estate, and encourages establishments to seek improvement in those outcomes where required. In addition to its annual inspection programme, the Inspectorate has recently developed new Independent Reviews of Progress, which will assess progress made by a prison in implementing recommendations from the previous inspection report.

The next Chief Inspector will be expected to continue to embed and refine these new processes. They will also ensure that the Inspectorate continues to produce high-quality, evidence-based inspection reports, which can inform the efforts of establishments, HMPPS and the Ministry of Justice to improve outcomes for detainees.

Key responsibilities

The Chief Inspector is responsible for:

- Delivering an independent inspection programme to assess outcomes for detainees in prisons, young offender institutes, immigration detention facilities and other places of custody. These are judged against HMIP's independent expectations, which are based on international human rights standards. The inspection programme also includes thematic inspections, looking at detainee experience across the custodial estate;
- Overseeing the publication of inspection reports and representing these reports publicly and in the media as required;
- Ensuring that the inspection methodology and expectations remain up to date and in line with best practice, including international human rights standards;
- Embedding the process of Independent Reviews of Progress, which aim to assess the progress a prison has made in implementing previous inspection recommendations;
- Reporting to Ministers, giving evidence to Parliamentary Select Committees and replying to policy and Parliamentary consultations as appropriate, drawing on evidence gathered during HMIP inspections.
- Delivering the UK's obligations under the Optional Protocol for the United Nations Convention Against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (OPCAT) for those in places of detention which fall under the remit of the Inspectorate;
- Accounting for the appropriate use of public resources in accordance with budgetary delegation arrangements.

Essential Criteria

Candidates will be able to demonstrate:

- Outstanding organisational leadership and experience of successfully managing resources balanced against competing priorities.
- Established experience managing demanding workloads and be at ease with a variety of stakeholders including prisoners and detainees, prison and immigration staff, senior managers and politicians;
- Highly developed inter-personal and communication skills and a proven ability to handle the media along with the ability to build and maintain successful working relationships and partnerships and deliver difficult and challenging messages;
- An ability to work collaboratively with inspectorate partners to enhance outcomes for prisoners and detainees.

- An ability to process and interpret complex information and to offer well developed analytical reasoning to inform judgements based on evidence;
- An ability to demonstrate robust financial management;
- Evidence of valuing and promoting diversity.

Desirable Criteria

The following criteria although not essential will also be taken into account by the selection panel:

- An understanding, or experience of working in another inspectorate or regulator;
- An understanding, or experience, of the policy, reform agenda, political and media landscape in which the Inspectorate works;
- An understanding, or experience of the criminal justice and immigration systems in the UK or comparable jurisdictions;

Tenure: Three years

Time commitment: Full Time

Remuneration: £135,000 per annum based on a 38-hour working week. Flexible working will be considered. The post is pensionable under the Civil Service Pension arrangements.

Advisory Assessment Panel

- Sir Richard Heaton, Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Justice;
- Cindy Butts, Appointments Chair for the Judicial Appointments Commission, The General Dental Council and the Solicitors Regulatory Authority and S\PM;
- Gerrard Lemos, HMPPS Non-Executive Director; and
- Juliet Lyons, Chair of the Independent Advisory Panel on Deaths in Custody.

Indicative timeframe:

- July - September Advertise
- Mid-September Sift
- Mid- October Interviews
- End November Justice Select Committee (JSC) Pre-Appointment Hearing
- December Appointment confirmed, and announcement expected in January 2020
- 1 February 2020 Appointment start date

Annex A

Essential criteria

- Outstanding leadership skills and experience, including successfully managing people, resources and finances, balanced against demanding workloads;
- Significant stakeholder management skills, highly developed inter-personal and communication skills, and a track record of collaborative working with a range of key stakeholders such as other Government Departments and inspectorates;
- A proven ability to handle the media along with the ability to deliver difficult and challenging messages;
- An ability to drive forward cultural transformation;
- An ability to process and interpret complex information and to offer well developed analytical reasoning to inform judgements based on evidence; and
- An ability to provide a strong insight into the health and educational needs of offenders, including those with additional needs and disabilities.

Desirable Criteria

The following criteria although not essential will also be taken into account by the selection panel:

- Additional relevant experience which is transferable to the running of a public body;
- An understanding, or experience, of the policy reform agenda, political and media landscape in which the Inspectorate works; and
- An understanding, or experience of the criminal justice and immigration system in the UK or comparable jurisdictions, or in a relevant area such as rehabilitation or reducing reoffending.

Letter from Rt Hon Robert Buckland QC MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice, dated 6 May 2020

Dear Bob

RECRUITMENT OF HER MAJESTY'S CHIEF INSPECTOR OF PRISONS

I am writing to update you about the campaign to recruit the next Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons (HMCIP). This is a Royal appointment, established by Section 5A of the Prison Act 1952.

As you know, the campaign originally launched in July 2019 under my predecessor, and has been disrupted by various events such as changes in the Ministerial team here, the General Election and the response to the Covid19 pandemic.

I strongly believe in a prison service that reforms offenders and that the Inspectorate has an important role to play in enhancing outcomes for prisoners and detainees. Having reviewed the role description and criteria in looking to reach my decision on an appointment, I did not consider that, as drafted, they fully reflected these aims for the Inspectorate. Consequently, I decided not to make an appointment from this campaign, preferring instead to re-run it with new criteria. This is no reflection on the skills and qualities of the candidates who took part in the campaign and I am grateful to them for their time and commitment in making an application.

As you will be aware, I have asked Peter Clarke to remain as Chief Inspector for the time being to continue to provide strong and effective leadership. I am, however, conscious of the uncertainty the lack of a permanent appointee will bring for staff in the Inspectorate and I am keen to make an appointment within the next six months. I am attaching a copy of the revised job description and role criteria, together with the outline timetable. We intend to advertise the role both on Cabinet Office Public Appointments website and online in The Times to secure as diverse a range of candidates as possible.

I would be grateful if you could let me have any views you may have on the documentation by 13 May. My officials will be in touch to agree a suitable date for the pre-appointment hearing but we are hoping that it may take place in September.

Yours sincerely

RT HON ROBERT BUCKLAND QC MP

Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons Recruitment 2020

The role of the Chief Inspector

We are looking for an exceptional candidate to fill this significant statutory Crown appointment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons.

Reporting directly to Ministers, the successful candidate will have a proven ability to act with integrity and independence from Government, and deliver the services under the Inspectorate's scrutiny.

The Inspectorate's methodology focuses on outcomes for those detained within the custodial estate, and encourages establishments to seek improvement in those outcomes where required. In addition to its annual inspection programme, the Inspectorate has, over the last year, introduced Independent Reviews of Progress, which will assess progress made by a prison in implementing previous recommendations in up to 20 prisons a year.

The next Chief Inspector will be expected to use their expertise to innovate and evolve the inspection approach to further strengthen the impact on the system outcomes Inspectorate. They will work to ensure that the Inspectorate produces high-quality, evidence-based reports, which are used to inform establishments, HMPPS and the Ministry of Justice to improve outcomes helping to turn people's lives around for good.

Key responsibilities

The Chief Inspector is responsible for:

- Delivering an independent inspection programme to assess outcomes for detainees in prisons, young offender institutes, immigration detention facilities and other places of custody. These are judged against HMIP's independent expectations, which are based on international human rights standards. The inspection programme also includes thematic inspections, looking at detainee experiences across the custodial estate and new short monitoring reports to maintain crucial inspectorate oversight in establishments during the Covid-19 pandemic;
- Overseeing the publication of inspection reports and representing the inspectorate publicly and in the media;
- Evolving the inspection methodologies and expectations so that they remain current and in line with best practice, including international human rights standards;
- Reporting to Ministers, giving evidence to Parliamentary Select Committees and replying to policy and Parliamentary consultations as appropriate, drawing on evidence gathered during HMIP inspections.
- Delivering the UK's obligations under the Optional Protocol for the United Nations Convention Against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (OPCAT) for those in places of detention which fall under the remit of the Inspectorate;
- Accounting for the appropriate use of public resources in accordance with budgetary delegation arrangements.

Essential criteria

- Outstanding leadership skills and experience which are transferable to the running of a public body including successfully managing resources and finances, balanced against demanding workloads;
- Significant stakeholder management skills and highly developed inter-personal and communication skills and a track record of collaborative working with a range of key stakeholders such as other Government Departments, inspectorates;
- A proven ability to handle the media along with the ability to deliver difficult and challenging messages;
- A proven track record of driving forward cultural transformation in a relevant area such as rehabilitation or reducing reoffending;
- An ability to process and interpret complex information and to offer well developed analytical reasoning to inform judgements based on evidence;
- An ability to provide a strong insight into the health and educational needs of offenders, including those with additional needs and disabilities.

Desirable Criteria

- The following criteria although not essential will also be taken into account by the selection panel:
- An understanding, or experience, of the policy reform agenda, political and media landscape in which the Inspectorate works;
- An understanding, or experience of the criminal justice and immigration system in the UK or comparable jurisdictions.

Appointment

- The preferred candidate for the post of HMCIP will be subject to scrutiny by Parliamentary select committee prior to appointment. The HM Chief Inspector of Prisons is appointed by Her Majesty the Queen on the recommendation of the Secretary of State for Justice.

Tenure

- The Appointment is for a fixed term, initially for three years, with the possibility of re-appointment for a further term on the advice of Ministers.
- Any reappointment is subject to satisfactory annual appraisals of the inspectorate's performance during the Chief Inspector's first term in the post.

Time commitment and remuneration

- The salary for this post is £135,000 per annum based on a 37-hour working week and is pensionable under the Civil Service Pension arrangements.

Panel Membership

- Panel Chair: Senior MoJ representative
- MoJ NED: MoJ Non-Executive Director
- Senior Independent Panel Member (SIPM)
- Independent Expert

Indicative Timeline:

w/c 18 May: Advertise

w/c 22 June: Sift

w/c 6 July: Interviews

Mid-September: Pre-appointment scrutiny hearing

Mid-October: Royal approval and announcement

Reply from Sir Robert Neill MP, Chair, Justice Committee, dated 13 May 2020

Dear Robert,

Thank you for your letter dated 6 May regarding the recruitment of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons (HMCIP).

Like you, we believe that the Inspectorate has a vital role in enhancing outcomes for prisoners and detainees. Peter Clarke has carried out his duties as Chief Inspector to a very high standard and we believe it is important that his successor continues to provide strong leadership.

We have noted the changes to the selection criteria from the previous recruitment campaign, particularly the new requirement that the candidate have "A proven track record of driving forward cultural transformation in a relevant area such as rehabilitation or reducing reoffending." We are concerned that this may limit the pool of applicants to those with experience in the prisons or probation sectors. Candidates with different backgrounds, who would otherwise be highly capable of performing the role, will not be eligible.

As you will be aware, Peter Clarke had a distinguished career in the police prior to his appointment as HMCIP, and Chief Inspectors before him came from a variety of professional backgrounds. These examples show that direct experience of working in prisons or probation, while perhaps desirable, is by no means necessary to leading the Inspectorate. Indeed, there could be value in having someone with a broader perspective overseeing the Inspectorate's work.

To ensure that a range of talented candidates can apply, we therefore recommend that the above requirement is reconsidered or clarified accordingly.

Yours sincerely,
Sir Robert Neill MP
Chair
Justice Committee

Response from Rt Hon Robert Buckland QC MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice, dated 19 May 2020

Dear Bob,

RECRUITMENT OF HER MAJESTY'S CHIEF INSPECTOR OF PRISONS

Thank you for your letter of 13 May. I am grateful to you and the Committee for considering our recruitment plans.

You have highlighted a concern that the requirement for candidates to have "A proven track record of driving forward cultural transformation in a relevant area such as rehabilitation or reducing reoffending", might limit the pool of applicants to those with experience in the prisons or probation sectors.

I fully accept what you say about the varied professional backgrounds of former Chief Inspectors who have served with distinction. The references to rehabilitation and reducing offending were illustrative and it was not my intention to seek to restrict the pool of applicants to those with a prison or probation background.

Having considered all comments received on the specification, I have, therefore, instructed officials to amend the essential criterion to:

- “An ability to drive forward cultural transformation”

And to amend the second desirable criterion to now read:

- “An understanding, or experience of the criminal justice and immigration system in the UK or comparable jurisdictions, or in a relevant area such as rehabilitation or reducing reoffending”.

The full set of role criteria is attached at **Annex A**. The advert will be launched on 20 May and I will be pleased to keep the Committee informed on the progress of this campaign. Thank you again for your comments.

Yours ever

RT HON ROBERT BUCKLAND QC MP

Letter from Rt Hon Robert Buckland QC MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice, dated 5 August 2020

Dear Bob,

RECRUITMENT OF HER MAJESTY’S CHIEF INSPECTOR OF PRISONS

Further to our correspondence about recruiting the next Chief Inspector of Prisons, I am pleased to put forward Charlie Taylor as my preferred candidate for the Committee’s consideration.

Charlie Taylor has over twenty-five years’ experience within education and has a longstanding interest in youth justice. Mr Taylor presented a clear vision for the role and demonstrated a strong track record in leadership, data analysis and driving forward cultural transformation. His experience and qualities are those which I strongly believe will provide successful leadership to the Inspectorate, enhancing outcomes for prisoners and detainees, and supporting the prison service to reform offenders.

Mr Taylor is currently an adviser to the Department for Education (DfE) on the development of new school-based behaviour hubs. Mr Taylor has an impressive CV, having been Chair of the Youth Justice Board, Chief Executive Officer at the National College for Teaching and Leadership (NCTL), and as an Expert Advisor to the Department for Education. He has also led a number of reviews on behalf of the Government within youth justice. Mr Taylor’s CV is attached at **Annex A**.

No relevant interests or political activity has been declared by Mr Taylor. Confirmation of this, and information about the campaign are set out in **Annex B**.

Candidates were informed prior to application that the position was subject to scrutiny by the Justice Select Committee, and I understand a hearing has been scheduled to take place in September. As you are aware, the hearing is non-binding but I shall give careful consideration to the Committee's conclusions before deciding whether to proceed with the appointment.

The role criteria, tenure and remuneration, advisory assessment panel membership, process and details of applications received are set out in the attached annexes.

An announcement has been made on 5 August confirming Mr Taylor as my preferred candidate for the role.

Yours ever

RT HON ROBERT BUCKLAND QC MP

Appendix B: Information about the recruitment campaign

Annex B

Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prison Pre-appointment hearing with the Justice Select Committee

Information on the preferred candidate:

Name of the preferred candidate:	Charlie Taylor
Candidate's current CV (redacted for publication)	Annex A
Declaration of relevant interests made by the candidate	None
Declaration of relevant political activity in the last five years, made by the candidate required under paragraph 9.2 of the Governance Code on Public Appointments	None
Proposed terms of appointment and remuneration (if any)	• Tenure: three years • Time Commitment: full time • Remuneration: £135,000 per annum, based on a working week of 37 hours

Campaign Information

Campaign launch date	20 May 2020
Campaign closing date	15 June 2020
Reason for any changes in timetable to that originally published	Not applicable
Advertising strategy	The role was advertised on The Times Online, the Cabinet Office Public Appointments website, NEDs on Board, Women on Board.
Advisory Assessment Panel	Panel Chair: James Bowler, Director General, Policy, Communications and Analysis Group, Ministry of Justice. SIPM: Sir Peter Rubin, Emeritus Professor of Medicine, University of Nottingham. Other members: Mark Rawlinson, Lead Non-Executive Director (NED); Wendy Williams, Her Majesty's Inspector, Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary and Fire & Rescue Services.
Number of applicants	21
Number of candidates invited to interview	Five
Number of candidates found appointable	Two

Diversity Data:

It has not been possible to provide diversity data in line with the guidance notes provided in the “*Cabinet Office Guidance: pre-appointment scrutiny by House of Commons select committees*”.

Notes on diversity data

1. Departments must consider their obligations under data protection legislation when sharing this data with select committees. Candidates must be made aware at the outset of the campaign that their data will be shared with the select committee in this way. The data should not be shared in a way which means that individuals are identifiable.
2. Departments should follow ONS guidance on statistical disclosure control to meet this requirement. Where there are fewer than 5 candidates in any given category, diversity data must not be shared as this is potentially identifiable. For example, if you have six women and four men on a shortlist - you should not give any gender information.

Table A: Gender

	Percent Male	Percent Female	Percent identified another way	Percent not declared
Candidate percentages	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

Table B: Ethnicity

	Percent White	Percent Ethnic Minority	Percent not declared
Candidate percentages	N/A	N/A	N/A

Table C: Disability

	Percent Disabled	Percent Non-disabled	Percent not declared
Candidate percentages	N/A	N/A	N/A

Appendix C: Job Advertisement

The role of the Chief Inspector

Reporting directly to Ministers, the successful candidate will have a proven ability to act with integrity and independence from Government, and deliver the services under the Inspectorate's scrutiny.

The Inspectorate's methodology focuses on outcomes for those detained within the custodial estate, and encourages establishments to seek improvement in those outcomes where required. In addition to its annual inspection programme, the Inspectorate has, since 2019, introduced Independent Reviews of Progress, which will assess progress made by a prison in implementing previous recommendations in up to 20 prisons a year.

The next Chief Inspector will be expected to use their expertise to innovate and evolve the inspection approach to further strengthen the work and impact of the Inspectorate. They will work to ensure that the Inspectorate produces high-quality, evidence-based reports, which are used to help establishments, HMPPS and the Ministry of Justice to improve outcomes and help to turn people's lives around.

Key responsibilities

The Chief Inspector for Prisons is responsible for:

- Delivering an independent inspection programme to assess outcomes for detainees in prisons, young offender institutions, immigration detention facilities and other places of custody falling within the remit of the Inspectorate. These are judged against HMIP's independent Expectations, which are underpinned by international human rights standards. The inspection programme also includes thematic inspections, looking at detainee experiences across the custodial estate, and Independent Reviews of Progress, designed to measure progress against inspection recommendations in selected prisons.
- Overseeing the publication of inspection reports and representing the inspectorate publicly and in the media;
- Keeping inspection methodologies and Expectations under constant review to ensure that HMIP remains an exemplar of international best practice.
- Reporting to Ministers, giving evidence to Parliamentary Select Committees and replying to policy and Parliamentary consultations as appropriate, drawing on evidence gathered during HMIP inspections.
- Delivering the UK's obligations under the Optional Protocol for the United Nations Convention Against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (OPCAT) for those in places of detention which fall under the remit of the Inspectorate;
- Accounting for the appropriate use of public resources in accordance with budgetary delegation arrangements.

Person Specification

Essential criteria

- Outstanding leadership skills and experience, including successfully managing people, resources and finances, balanced against demanding workloads;
- Significant stakeholder management skills, highly developed inter-personal and communication skills, and a track record of collaborative working with a range of key stakeholders such as other Government Departments and inspectorates;
- A proven ability to handle the media along with the ability to deliver difficult and challenging messages;
- An ability to drive forward cultural transformation;
- An ability to process and interpret complex information and to offer well developed analytical reasoning to inform judgements based on evidence; and
- An ability to provide a strong insight into the health and educational needs of offenders, including those with additional needs and disabilities.

Desirable Criteria

The following criteria although not essential will also be taken into account by the selection panel:

- Additional relevant experience which is transferable to the running of a public body;
- An understanding, or experience, of the policy reform agenda, political and media landscape in which the Inspectorate works; and
- An understanding, or experience of the criminal justice and immigration system in the UK or comparable jurisdictions, or in a relevant area such as rehabilitation or reducing reoffending.

Eligibility

This appointment is open to British or Commonwealth citizens, British Dependent Territories citizens, British Nationals (Overseas) citizens, British protected persons, citizens of the Republic of Ireland, European Economic Area (EEA) nationals or to those of other member states, and to certain non-EEA family members. Applicants must have rights of residence in the UK.

We welcome applications from all those who are eligible.

Existing Government Employees

As Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Prisons was established to carry out an independent function at arm's length from the Government, we are mindful that appointing someone who is employed by a government department might compromise that independence – or perception of independence – as well as diminishing the confidence of stakeholders and the general public. If you are in receipt of a salary from a government department and

wish to apply, you should expect that – if selected for interview – the Advisory Assessment Panel will explore whether any perceived or real conflicts of interest might exist if you were to be appointed and, if so, how this might be managed or mitigated. The latter might include an undertaking to resign from government employment, if appointed, and – if considered appropriate – for there to be an interval between resignation and taking up appointment as HMCIP.

Additional Information

Pre-Appointment Scrutiny information:

The preferred candidate for the post of HMCIP will be subject to scrutiny by the Justice Select Committee prior to appointment. The successful candidate is appointed by Her Majesty the Queen on the recommendation of the Secretary of State for Justice.

Annual leave allowance will be 31 ½ days with pay. In addition, one privilege day and eight bank holidays are to be taken at fixed times of the year.

The post-holder will normally be based at HMI Prison's offices in 10 South Colonnade, Canary Wharf, London. Due to the Covid-19 pandemic, HMIP staff are currently working from home for the foreseeable future, in line with the current government advice.

Travelling expenses may not be paid for journeys from home to the base Inspectorate office, but travel and subsistence allowances may be payable when the Chief Inspector is required to travel and/or stay away overnight in the course of their duties on the same basis as that applicable to senior civil servants.

Appendix D: Curriculum vitae – Charlie Taylor

Employment

September 1989 to 2006, Teacher

- Taught at primary and secondary schools in central London, specialising in improving children's behaviour.

January 2006 to April 2011, Head Teacher

Head teacher the Willows Special School for children with severe emotional and behavioural difficulties, Hillingdon, West London

- “Outstanding” Ofsted rating: October 2007 and March 2010.

July 2010 to April 2011, Head Teacher

- Acting headship Chantry Special School, Hillingdon.

April 2011 to September 2012, Expert Adviser

Expert adviser on children's behaviour to the government, Department for Education

- Advised ministers and Secretary of State on improving behaviour in English schools.
- Producing two reports in the wake of the 2011 riots:
 - Improving attendance in school.
 - Improving alternative provision for excluded children.
- Both reports led to significant changes in government policy and a sustained improvement in attendance in schools.

September 2012 – September 2015, Chief Executive Officer

Chief Executive National College for Teaching and Leadership (NCTL).

- Oversaw an initial budget of nearly £500m and a staff of 450
- Led the merger of two large DfE agencies
- Presided over reductions in administration budget and staff numbers whilst achieving high ratings in the annual civil service staff survey and maintaining standards of delivery.
- Introduced new governance arrangements that reduced duplication and cost, while giving better assurance to the permanent secretary, and the Audit and Risk Committee of the Department for Education.
- Responsible for the recruitment of 30,000 new teachers per year.

- Oversaw the development and roll out of School Direct that allowed schools to train their own teachers. In 2015 we achieved our target that half of all teachers should be trained through the programme – a transformation in the way teachers are trained in England.
- Responsible for teacher regulation in England, presiding over a quasi-judicial system that runs hearings into unacceptable professional conduct including high-profile cases such as the Birmingham “Trojan Horse” enquiry into radicalisation in schools.
- Worked with a wide range of interested parties including trade unions, head teachers, Ofsted, parliamentarians and other government departments.

September 2015 to December 2016 Director, Ministry of Justice

- Commissioned by the Lord Chancellor to conduct a review into the Youth Justice System in England and Wales.
- Engaged closely with ministers and wide range of practitioners, lobby groups, academics, the Home Office, the prison service and local authority leaders across the UK to complete a comprehensive review.
- The review was published in December 2016 proposing far-reaching and radical reforms across the youth justice system, in particular to youth custody, courts and sentencing and the way young offenders are dealt with in the community. The report forms the backbone of the government’s Youth Justice Reform Programme.

April 2017 to March 2020, Chair of the Youth Justice Board (YJB)

Chair of the Youth Justice Board (YJB) for England and Wales, an arms-length body of the Ministry of Justice that advises the government on matters of youth justice and oversees and funds the work of Local Authority, Youth Offending Teams. Responsible for oversight of risk, finances, setting the strategic direction with a staff of 90 and a budget of £70m.

- Refocussed the organisation to concentrate on 6 specific priorities including serious youth violence, safety in custody and the over-representation of BAME children in the youth justice system.
- Built the reputation of the YJB as an authoritative and effective body providing straightforward, honest advice to Ministers from across Whitehall.
- Supporting officials in Ministry of Justice, the Home Office, the Department of Health and social care, the Department for Education and the Cabinet Office in developing policy to address the challenges in the youth justice system including serious youth violence.
- Supported officials and ministers in recruiting the first provider of a Secure School.

January to July 2019 Independent Review into the Use of Pain Inducing Techniques in the Youth Secure Estate

This in-depth review of restraint practice in Young Offenders Institutions was commissioned by ministers in response to a court case brought by a human right group. The review, providing recommendations for changes in policy is due to be published in June 2020.

September 2019 to present

Adviser to the Department for Education on the development of new school-based behaviour hubs.

My work has led to frequent appearances on television and radio where I am confident performer. I also speak at events around the country about youth justice or education. I have made five appearances before select committees.

Witnesses

The following witnesses gave evidence. Transcripts can be viewed on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

Tuesday 15 September 2020

Charlie Taylor

Formal minutes

Tuesday 15 September 2020

Members present:

Sir Robert Neill, in the Chair

Paula Barker	Kenny MacAskill
Richard Burgon	Dr Kieran Mullan
Maria Eagle	Andy Slaughter
John Howell	

Draft Report (*Appointment of HM Chief Inspector of Prisons*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

Ordered, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 11 read and agreed to.

Annexe agreed to.

Papers were appended to the Report as Appendices A to D.

Resolved, That the Report be the Eighth Report of the Committee to the House.

Ordered, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

Ordered, That embargoed copies of the Report be made available, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order No. 134.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 22 September at 1.45 pm]

List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

All publications from the Committee are available on the [publications page](#) of the Committee's website. The reference number of the Government's response to each Report is printed in brackets after the HC printing number.

Session 2019–21

First Report	Appointment of Chair of the Office for Legal Complaints	HC 224
Second Report	Sentencing Council consultation on changes to magistrates' court sentencing guidelines	HC 460
Third Report	Coronavirus (COVID-19): The impact on probation services	HC 461
Fourth Report	Coronavirus (COVID-19): The impact on prisons	HC 299
Fifth Report	Ageing prison population	HC 304
Sixth Report	Coronavirus (COVID-19): The impact on courts	HC 519
Seventh Report	Coronavirus (COVID-19): the impact on the legal professions in England and Wales	HC 520
First Special Report	Prison Governance: Government Response to the Committee's First Report of Session 2019	HC 150
Second Special Report	Court and Tribunal Reforms: Government Response to the Committee's Second Report of Session 2019	HC 151
Third Special Report	Transforming Rehabilitation: Follow-up: Government Response to the Committee's Nineteenth Report of Session 2017–19	HC 152